

## **Chapter Four**

### **Finding and discussion**

In this chapter, the researcher show and explain the finding of the data analysis on the use of pronoun in LTC UMY. This chapter also presents the discussion of the data analysis result. In the finding, the data is shown in the error categories that were found in the students' writing. The discussion section discussed about the error from the four categories that was presented in the finding.

#### **Finding**

The data used in this study was essay writing which were collected from LTC UMY. The participants were second semester students of International Relation major who is taking regular class. There were 25 documents were collected from 25 students of regular class. The data were gained directly from the lecturer. After got all of the data, the researcher retyped the data and processed it using SCP 4.09.

After the data were processed in the SCP 4.09, the data were shortlisted with the keyword consisting of 18 pronouns (see Appendix D for types of pronoun information). The researcher then classified the finding based on the personal pronoun case. The finding showed there were four types of errors that occurred in the students' writing work. Those errors were classified into four categories, they were: Misformation in Singular and plural pronoun reference agreement, Error in pronoun antecedence agreement, Error on the use of its and it's, Error on the use of subject and object case.

**Misformation between singular and plural pronoun reference agreement.** When writers write something, they have to make sure that the information that is written in the text is consistent to avoid miscommunication. When writers mention a single or collective subject, the pronoun that refers to the subject must be in the same form (Hacker, 1995). In this case, the researcher found several errors occur in the students writing. The following table shows the errors made by the students:

Table 7

*Sample of sentence with error reference agreement*

Case Categories	Example	Correction Suggestion
Subjective case	1. But <u>I</u> couldn't <u>we</u> about the view I saw.	1. But <u>I</u> couldn't <u>tell</u> about the view I saw.
	2. <u>Isn't cat</u> cute right, <u>they</u> are so colourfull.	2. <u>Isn't cat</u> cute right, <u>it</u> is so colourfull.
	3. <u>Samsung</u> do this because <u>they</u> want to push down competitors product.	3. <u>Samsung</u> do this because <u>it</u> want to push down competitors product
Objective case	1. It is very important to <u>each</u> <u>person</u> . Same as <u>them</u> , home is the best place.	1. It is very important to <u>each</u> <u>person</u> . Same as <u>him/her</u> , home is the best place.
	2. My parents had <u>2 cars</u> at home. They rarely use <u>it</u> .	2. My parents had <u>2 cars</u> at home. They rarely use <u>them</u> .
Possessive case	1. I think the "feel" is important for <u>Manga Artist</u> too. This is <u>their</u>	1. I think the "feel" is important for <u>Manga Artist</u> too. This is

---

job.	<u>his/her</u> job.
2. <u>Both city</u> have <u>it</u> own advantages.	2. <u>Both city</u> have <u>their</u> own advantages.
3. <u>Samsung</u> hope <u>their</u> customer will considered the choices.	3. <u>Samsung</u> hope <u>its</u> customer will considered the choices.

---

The table showed that the participants had problem in choosing the suitable pronoun for its references. Several sentences showed that the students write plural pronoun form for singular reference, such as “Isn’t cat cute right, they are so colourfull.” The explanation and the other example of sentence which contained error was discussed in the following section.

*Subjective case.* It can be seen several sentences such as “But I couldn’t we about the view I saw.”, “Isn’t cat cute right, they are so colourfull” and “Samsung do this because they want to push down competitors product.” The three different sentences indicated that the error occurred because the participant missed several informations that should be written in the sentence to make the sentence clear. On the other hand, the second sentence shows that the participant addressed the subject which was singular subject with plural pronoun. There is a probability about this case, the participant use the pronoun “they” to address the common *cat*, so it was not only the subject that was mentioned in the sentence. The participants are most likely to write based on the meaning of the message that they want to share. It can be seen from the sentence “Isn’t cat cute right, they are so colourfull.” The sentence had meaning even when the use of the pronoun was incorrect there. This case was not in line with grammatical rule. As it can be seen, the participant tried to refer the subject as the whole, not just subject that they mentioned in their writing. On the other hand, the third sentence shows that the participant write

singular pronoun for plural subject. This can be also link to grammatical term in Indonesian Language that Purwoko (1984) addressed as uncommon pronoun use. English has different pronoun for singular and plural unanimated things, in the other hand in Indonesian Language there is no pronoun for singular or plural unanimated things. So unconsciously the participants avoided the used of person pronoun for unanimated things.

*Objective case.* The same case also happens in the objective case, for example “It is very important to each person. Same as them, home is the best place.” The participant mentioned “each person”, logically when each person combine there will be a group of people. That could be the reason why the participant tend to choose the pronoun “them”. According to Hacker (1995), “each person” was classified into indefinite pronoun. This type of pronoun should be treated as singular even though the information that followed the pronouns might seem to have plural meaning. The next example is quite different, “My parents had 2 cars at home. They rarely use it.” It is clear that the participant mentioned two subject and use incorrect pronoun to refer to the object. When talking about unanimated things in Indonesian Language, the unanimated thing didn't have any pronoun. Purwoko (1984) mentioned that it was unusual for Indonesian to refer unanimated object whether it was singular or plural using person pronouns. The pronoun “they” when translated to Indonesian Language, was used to refer person. In addition, English has pronoun for unanimated object, so the participants choose what was most likely to be acceptable to refer to a thing which is the pronoun “it”

*Possessive case.* The same case happens in the possessive case. As in the objective case, the participant tend to choose pronoun based on the meaning rather than grammatical function. This can be seen from the sentence showed in the previous table. The sentence had meaning despite of the error in the use of pronoun. For example “I think the “feel” is important for Manga

Artist too. This is their job.”, “Samsung hope their customer will considered the choices.” The last sentence is pretty much different from the other two sentences. It can be seen that the participant mention “Samsung” as a company which mean as one unit, this can be from the previous sentence “Samsung is the pioner technology”. It meant that the use of pronoun “their” was not correct. The other sentence was “Both city have it own advantages.” As it was mentioned earlier in the subjective case it was unusual for Indonesian to refer unanimated object whether it was singular or plural using person pronouns. Unconsciously, the participants will avoid the use of person pronoun for unanimated objects.

**Error in pronoun antecedence agreement.** Pronoun antecedence more or less is similar to pronoun reference. A pronoun should have antecedence, or the thing that a pronoun refers to. Hacker (1995) suggested that a pronoun should clearly refer to its antecedence, if this didn’t happen the sentence will be ambiguous. When the writer fails to show the antecedence of a pronoun, the information of the writing will be interpreted differently from the writer perception and idea. This case will lead to misunderstanding. In addition, if the pronoun used by the writer doesn’t show agreement with its antecedence, it will also lead to misunderstanding.

Table 8

*Sample sentence with error pronoun antecedence agreement*

<b>Case Categories</b>	<b>Example</b>	<b>Correction Suggestion</b>
Subjective case	1. she is just a cat but she wouldn’t dissapointing me and make me feel upset just like <u>they</u> are who made me feel dissapointed.	1. she is just a cat but she wouldn’t dissapoint me and make me feel upset just like <u>those</u> who made me feel

	2. Thailand language rule have some intonation and every intonation can make different meaning. And <u>they</u> used to intonation in their language.	dissapointed. 2. Thailand language rule have some intonation and every intonation can make different meaning. And <u>Thai people</u> used to intonation in their language.
Objective case	1. Moza is a Persian cat and had grey and white and little bit cream colours that I very like <u>it</u> . 2. When the night come, if there is no cloud cover <u>them</u> , we can see a lot of stars shining so bright.	1. Moza is a Persian cat and had grey and white and little bit cream colours that I very like <u>the fur</u> . 2. When the night come, if there is no cloud cover <u>the sky</u> , we can see a lot of stars shining so bright.
Possessive case	1. Ellen's show just aired on tv in 2003 and expanded <u>her</u> career through "ellentube". 2. Also I tought if you want to know <u>someone's</u> attitude just look how <u>his</u> acts to the animals	1. Ellen's show just aired on tv in 2003 and <u>Ellen</u> expanded <u>her</u> career through "ellentube". 2. Also I tought if you want to know <u>someone's</u> attitude just look how <u>his/her</u> acts to the animals

*Subjective case.* When we talk about antecedence in subjective case, it should refer to subject of the sentence (Hacker, 1995). However, the table shows pronoun that completely refer to something that was not written in the sentence, For example in the subjective case “she is just a cat but she wouldn’t dissapointing me and make me feel upset just like they are who made me feel dissapointed.” The antecedence for the pronoun “they” is not present in the sentence. The other sentences show the pronoun which had ambiguous antecedence, “Thailand language rule have some intonation and every intonation can make different meaning. And they used to intonation in their language.” It was not clear what “they” refers to in the sentence. The participant mentioned several things in the sentence which can be the antecedence of the pronoun “they” whether it is the language, the people who speak the language, or the rule of the language. Everyone who read the sentence will probably have different perspective for the pronoun “they”, which is why it is important to make the antecedence of the pronoun clear.

*Objective case.* The case in objective form is quite similar with the case above, the pronoun use in the sentences has unclear antecedence, for example “Moza is a Persian cat and had grey and white and little bit cream colours that I very like it”. In the other hand, in this case in the following example “When the night come, if there is no cloud cover them, we can see a lot of stars shining so bright” the participant fail to show the antecedence for the pronoun “them” therefore the pronoun “them” did not have antecedence.

*Possessive case.* The sentence “Ellen’s show just aired on tv in 2003 and expanded her career through “ellentube”” shows that the participant use the pronoun “her” to refer to Ellen career. Meanwhile, in the sentence, the participant only mentioned “Ellen’s show” which was an

object. Ellen was not mentioned in the sentence, so the use of pronoun “her” is grammatically incorrect. In the other hand, the second example “Also I thought if you want to know someone’s attitude just look how his acts to the animals” showed that the use of pronoun was in the same form which was singular, however the participant did not mentioned the exact gender of the indefinite pronoun, therefore the use of “his” was incorrect.

**Error in the use of *its* and *it’s*.** Based on the data analysis on this category, the error on the use of pronoun “its” and the word “it’s” only happened in the possessive case. The following error made by the participant is what Truss (2004) considered as "the greatest solecism in the world of punctuation". This was because the participant failed to use correct form of the pronoun “its”, this pronoun was highly misplaced by “it’s”, as we know that the word “it’s” is contraction for “it is” or “it has” (Hacker, 1995). The following table show the error in using “its” and “it’s”.

Table 9

*Sample sentence with error in the use of its and it’s*

<b>Case Categories</b>	<b>Example</b>	<b>Correction Suggestion</b>
Possessive case	1. Orion has 3 stars as <u>it’s</u> belt.	1. Orion has 3 stars as <u>its</u> belt.
	2. So when I finish drawing, even if <u>its</u> ugly, i still feeling satisfied	2. So when I finish drawing, even if <u>it’s</u> ugly, i still feeling satisfied

The table shows that the error only happened in possessive case where the pronoun “its” used. The table showed that the participant used “its” and “it’s” in a wrong way. The participants use “its” to refer to “it is” while the word “it’s” was used as a pronoun, for example “Orion has 3



stars as it's belt." The other example is "So when I finish drawing, even if its ugly, i still feeling satisfied." The use of pronoun "its" in the second sentence was incorrect because it was not use to modify the noun "ugly". On the other word, there was no subject which posses the word "ugly".

**Error in the use of subject and object form.** This type of problem did not commonly occur in the participants essay writing comparing to the other problem found in the participants essay writing. The case in this point is that there were errors in using subject or object case pronoun in the sentence. Similar with the problem in the use of "its" and "it's", the participants write the subject and object case pronoun in reverse. Hacker (1995) mentioned that when a subject or an object appeared in the form of compound form, it might be confusing for some people. Based on the data analysis, this problem was only found in subjective and possessive case. The following table shows the example of the sentences which contain error in the use of subject and object case pronoun.

Table 10

*Sample sentence with error in the use of subject and object form*

<b>Case Categories</b>	<b>Example</b>	<b>Correction Suggestion</b>
Subjective case	<u>Me and my</u> friend <u>chose</u> to take a break in every 15 minutes.	<u>I and my</u> friend <u>chose</u> to take a break in every 15 minutes.
Possessive case	<u>She's</u> eyeballs just like the other Persian cat, nothing special with it."	<u>Her</u> eyeballs just like the other Persian cat, nothing special with it."

As we can see in the subjective case pronoun, all of the sentences contain the pronoun “me” followed by conjunction and the other pronoun or subject. This can be a little bit complex for the students as the use of “me” in the sentences was incorrect.

*Subjective case.* We can see in the sentence “Me and my friend chose to take a break in every 15 minutes.” The use of pronoun “me” in the sentence was incorrect because it is supposed to be in subjective case, the word “me and my friend” is the subject from the verb “chose”. When we are facing this type of pronoun, Hacker (1995) suggested that we could simply put the all of the compound word group away except the pronoun. Thus, we can see the correct form of the pronoun we should use. The other sentences have the same case as the previous sentences. The pronoun chose in the sentence also the same as the previous sentence which was “me”. The correct pronoun should be “I” because it is in the subjective case.

*Possessive case.* The participant chose the wrong pronoun in the possessive case. In the sentence “She’s eyeballs just like the other Persian cat, nothing special with it.” the participant used the pronoun “she” to replace the possessive form of the third person singular female pronoun which is “her”. This case can be related to the possessive noun “-‘s” to imply possession. The use of “she’s” here is completely incorrect.

## **Discussion**

The result of the study shows that from the 18 pronoun which were being analyzed, only 12 pronouns were written incorrectly, the pronouns are me, my, she, her, his, him, we, they, their, them, it and its. In this case, the participant knew well how to use the other pronouns. The error that was shown in the result can be influenced by the participants’ Indonesian Language. If

we are talking about pronoun, Indonesian Language has simpler pronoun form than English. In the other hand, learning English pronoun is more complex.

The pronouns error that is shown in the finding reveals that there were no errors in the use of first person pronoun. The participants did not have problem in using pronoun “I” as it is usually used to clarify their position as the writer, for example “That is why here I would like to compare...” Kaplan (1995) mentioned that first and second person pronoun do not have antecedence. Therefore even when the writer did not mention the specific subject or person in the writing, the error in the use of first and second person pronoun would not occur. That is why there was no error in the use of pronoun “I” and “you” in the participants’ writing.

Related to the point above, we can see there are error in the use of first person pronoun “me” and “my”. Actually, there is only one error occur in the use of pronoun “my”, here is the sentence “Because that can waste our time and made my holiday incomplete.” The sentence showed that there is no agreement between the pronoun mentioned earlier and after conjunction. Despite the case that the pronoun “my” can be used to position the writer, there is no agreement between two pronouns used in the sentence. The pronoun “our” in the sentence was referring to the writer and his/her friends which mean that it was only the writer whose holiday was incomplete while his/her friends felt the holiday was fine even their time was wasted.

In the other hand, the pronoun “me” which is an objective form of personal pronoun was used in the subjective form by the participants, for example “People stay there because me and my brother is living outside.” The word “me and my brother” was the subject of the verb is living, that is why the pronoun should be in the subjective form. DeCapua (2008) explained that an objective pronoun used as the object of verb or preposition and have to be in objective form.

The errors that occur were all in the compound subject. This case was caused by interlingual transfer, as Brown (2000) explained it as negative influence of the learner's mother tongue. Indonesian Language only use pronoun "saya" or "aku" in subjective or objective case. In the other hand, English has different pronoun of subjective and objective case. This case showed that the participants had problem in distinguishing English pronoun for subjective and objective case because the influence of their Indonesian Language.

The influence of Indonesian Language played a big number in error occurrence. Purwoko (1984) stated that pronoun in Indonesian Language is only divided into three group, while English has five group of pronoun. In Indonesian Language, second person pronoun could not be used to refer to unanimated object, only the third person pronoun can be used to refer to the unanimated object and animal. In the other hand, English has second person pronoun for unanimated object and unidentified-gender animal which is "it". In addition, Indonesian Language does not have the masculine, feminine, and non-person pronoun, they simply only general group 1<sup>st</sup> person, 2<sup>nd</sup> person and 3<sup>rd</sup> person pronoun.

This case was in line with the researcher's finding in this sentence, "My parents had 2 cars at home. They rarely use it." In the sentence, the participant talked about two cars that was owned by his/her parents. However, the participant use pronoun "it" to refer to the two cars and this could be classified as an error since the participant had already identify the number of the car. Indonesian Language doesn't have different pronoun for unanimated things. It is also uncommon to refer unanimated things as "mereka". In Indonesian language it was not acceptable to refer unanimated object or animal using personal pronoun in the term of language and custom (Alwi et al. 1991). Thus, this case affected participants' writing.

Furthermore, the finding also showed that the participants had problem in differentiating the use of “its” and “it’s”. In speaking and writing form, it is common to use suffixes “-’s” or “-s’ ” in the end of a name or thing to show the possession. Azar (2002) labeled the word as possessive nouns. Possessive nouns similar with possessive pronoun are used to show ownership and possession. If we write a singular possessive noun we simply add “-‘s” at the end of the word. In relation to the case here, pronoun “it” is singular, because the participants familiar with the use of “-‘s”, for them to make pronoun “it” become possessive the participants simply add “-‘s” at the end of the word.

After all, the most common error occurred in the participants writing work was located in the singular and plural reference agreement (See table C1). This case was caused by mother tongue interference. There are several factors related to the mother tongue interference such as no pronoun for non-person collective nouns in Indonesian Language so when the participant wrote “Both cities have it own advantages”, the participant chose to use the pronoun “it” to refer the collective noun “Both cities”. However, there is also other participant who wrote the other way around, as in the sentence “Isn’t cat cute right, they are so colourfull.” Even though, the sentence show that the participant understood the use of pronoun “they” to refer animal is acceptable in English, still there is no agreement between the pronoun and its reference.

After all, the errors that occur in the participants essay writing are mainly caused by the influence of their Indonesian Language. Even though some of the participants show the understanding on how to use several pronouns, still they made error in the production due to the differentiation of grammatical function of the language.