

CHAPTER II

THE DYNAMICS OF FOREIGN POLICY BETWEEN TURKEY AND ISRAEL

Foreign Policy of a state is often influenced by the situations of domestic situation in the state itself such as socio-cultural conditions, economic conditions, political conditions, and national interest. The government of a state will maintain its domestic conditions before they conduct their foreign policy. The abnormal condition of a state will be difficult to gain the relations with other states. Therefore, this chapter will provide an explanation about the dynamics of foreign policy between Turkey and Israel. Before the writer explains about the dynamics of Turkish Foreign Policy to Israel, the writer will firstly explain about the domestic conditions in Turkey which can influence the decision making process of Turkish foreign policy.

A. General Description of Turkey

1. Socio – Cultural Conditions of Turkey

Turkey, located in Southeastern Europe and Southwestern Asia, is the only muslim majority state which is implementing secularism constitution. The population of this country is 80,274,604 people, and 99.8% is muslim population which is mostly sunni, around 0.2% of Turkish citizens believe in other religion such as Armenia orthodox, Greek orthodox, and Catholics. Among these minorities religion, Christian and Jews are the highest religion believed of the people. The majority people in Turkey are derived from Turkish ethnic with the

percentage of 70-75%. Kurdish becomes the second largest ethnic with the percentage of 19%, and followed by other minority ethnics. The capital city of this state is actually Ankara, but the most crowded city is Istanbul (The World Factbook, 2016).



Figure 2.1 - Map of Turkey

Source: <https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/geos/tu.html>

Looking at the picture of the map above, the strategic location becomes the main reason why Istanbul becomes the most populous city in Turkey. Istanbul becomes the bridge to connect Europe and Asia. Trading, traveling, and culture are always moving around through this city. Besides the strategic location of Istanbul which is located in the middle of two continents, Asia and Europe, Istanbul is also well known as a city which is full of history. It has been noted since the era of Byzantium and Constantinople until the Ottoman Empire era occurred in this city. Therefore, this city left so many kinds of unique cultures which attracted foreigners to visit it.

It had been long time ago that the social condition of Turkey was shaped by so many aspects such as historical events and immigration. The immigration was affected by the trading era in the past in which it brought many people with different ethnics to live in Turkey especially in Istanbul. This situation made Istanbul to be different with other cities where Turks becomes the majority of its citizens. If Turks became the significant in almost every city in Turkey, Rome and Greek became the majority ethnics which lived in Istanbul. Meanwhile, Kurds mostly lived in the South-East Turkey.

The ethnics in Turkey especially for Turks and Kurds become the social important issue to be discussed nowadays. Kurds is the minority ethnic in Turkey and Kurds is the biggest minorities which does not have any state in the Middle-East. The problem comes when there is no satisfaction or justice. The injustice conditions are what Kurds feel during the police which are created by Turkish government. This situation makes Kurds want to rebel and separate from the main state, Turkey.

Even though the majority ethnic of Turkish people is Turk, they are actually still divided into some groups. Turks, the dominant ethnic in Turkey was derived from some tribes such as Mongol and Han (Aschner, Bane, Kaiser, & Sène, 2009). The huge number of immigration thousands years ago caused Turks ethnic including Anatolian Turks, the most prominent; Rumelian Turks, and Central Asian Turks. There is no significant conflict among them as the Turks ethnics even if they are still divided into three small groups.

Besides the social condition, Turkish government can maintain and sustain their culture as well. The Ottoman Empire introduced and built Western-style institutions for the first time, such as the Ottoman Imperial Museum in around 19th century. The collection of the museum grew rapidly due to the power of the empire. In 1891, the building of this museum was changed into the proper one, and recently the name is changed into Istanbul Archaeology Museum.

Turkey is really rich of culture. Besides the museum that they still keep the originality until now, ancient architect buildings, traditional arts, refreshments, and even movie can be their points of interest to attract the foreigners to come to their country. Turkey can benefit their culture to be their power. This is a kind of their soft diplomacy or well known as cultural diplomacy to introduce their country to international society.

2. The Political Conditions of Turkey

The empire was the first state system which was implemented by Pre - Turkey. The term of Pre – Turkey is used to show the era in which Republic of Turkey was not established. At first, the name of the regional area was actually not Turkey but Anatolia. The epistemology of Anatolia was derived from *Anatolē* or the sun rise or Asia Minor. It is located in South-West Asia. This region was the contested area because of the strategic situation for trading. Meanwhile, Turkey is the modern name after Mustafa Kemal Ataturk defeated the Ottoman Empire. Anatolia's citizens were people of various Empires such as Hittites

Empire in the 8th century BCE, The Persian Achaemenid Empire in the 6th and 5th centuries BCE, The Roman Empire, and The Islamic Ottoman Empire.

The modern Turkey is implementing republican parliamentary democracy as the form of the state system. It is like Indonesia in which it uses republican as the state system. A state which uses republican as their state system tends to get easy way to have international relations due to central government has full rights to control the state. In the system of republic, regional government has no rights to have direct relations with the international politics. The type of state system was divided into two parts which are republic and federal by International law.

To run the government, Turkey is conducting the theory of separation of power which divides power into three sections; those are executive, legislative, and Judicial. This theory was clearly introduced by Charles-Louis de Secondat, Baron de La Brède et de Montesquieu, known simply as Montesquieu. The argumentation of Montesquieu in his book under the title *The Spirit of Laws* argues that

The only way to avoid despotism, or absolute and arbitrary rule, is to divide the executive, legislative, and judicial branches of the government into three distinct bodies (1899, p. 53).

The divisions of power have function to balance out the government in order to gain more trust in society. Furthermore, the division of power is justice to all people, and it decreases the dominance of the ruler. The share of power inside the government system makes the executive creates the agenda of the state; legislative

becomes the bridge to connect society – government, and they have function to create the law; and Judicial is acted to review and guide the running of law.

Turkish elites try to adopt this idea and implement to their country. In Turkey, Executive is the president and the governmental structure. President as the head of state is voted directly by Turkish people for a 5-year term (eligible for a second term). Then, the President points one of parliament members of the Grand National Assembly of Turkey to be the Prime Minister. In Turkey, President is not only a symbol of a state while Prime Minister runs the government. Both President and Prime Minister work together to create a good government in Turkey. If the President is only a symbol, it is impossible for Turkish President, Erdogan to play a big role in restoring Turkey – Israel relations. Moreover, Erdogan is the one who gave three conditions to Israel if they would restore full diplomatic relations to Turkey.

Legislative branch in Turkey is Turkish people representative which consists of 550 seats, and its members are directly voted in multi-seat constituencies by proportional representation vote to serve 4-year terms (Aschner, Bane, Kaiser, & Sène, 2009). The functions and duties of Turkish legislative are almost similar with a state which implements the share of power. Creating and amending laws, scrutinizing the council of minister and minister, and approving the ratification of international treaties are the examples of Turkish legislative duties (The Grand National Assembly of Turkey). Meanwhile, the Turkish Judicial branch is similar with USA which is implementing multi-level of courts – such as Constitutional Court, Court of Cassation, and Council of State.

Turkey is the only state with the muslim majority which implements secularism as their ideology. Secularism means the separation between state and religion. This ideology was firstly constructed by Mustafa Kemal Atatürk at the beginning of his power in Turkey. Turkey is quite unique due to the combinations of Secularism, democracy, and Islam. The daughter of Erdogan, Sümeyye Erdoğan Bayraktar said that

Turkey showed to the whole world that secularism, democracy and Islam can live side by side. We have become a source of inspiration for other Muslim nations (Turkey showed secularism, democracy, Islam coexists: Sümeyye Erdoğan Bayraktar, 2016).

However, Turkey still has homework to overcome their domestic problem in order to make them easy to take action of their political decision as foreign policy. The emerging problem which has not been solved until now is the ethnicity problem with Kurds. Satisfaction and injustice feeling of decision become the main issue which makes this case to be difficult to be overcome. Noting the ideology, governmental and state system of Turkey are actually able to control the domestic political situation. Unfortunately, this problem is still running and becoming the obstacle for Turkey's constitutional government.

3. Economic Conditions of Turkey

Turkey becomes the 17th largest economic growth in the world. The collapse of their economy in 2001 increases their willing to develop their economic sector through many aspects such as agriculture, industry, and services. The downgrade of Turkish economic situations in 2011 was really important lesson. Turkey started to rebuild their economy after that difficult situation.

Benefitting the natural resources such as tobacco, cotton, grain, olives, sugar beets, hazelnuts, pulses, citrus; and livestock are becoming one of their main focuses to rise up their economic growth. Turkey can export those natural resources to other states which need this product. From the export, Turkey can increase the income of the state. Textiles, food processing, automobiles, electronics, mining (coal, chromate, copper, and boron), steel, petroleum, construction, lumber, and paper are also the industrial products of Turkey to be exported. Agriculture contributes 8.7%, and industry assists 27% of Turkish total composition of Gross Domestic Product (The World Factbook, 2016).

Turkey is categorized as the ancient state which is full of history and culture. The government of Turkey sees the opportunity guide international society to visit Turkey to see the ancient art, archeology, and Turkish traditional culture. By implementing a good service toward the visitors, Turkey, especially Istanbul becomes the first destination of tourism object which is a must to be visited. The data which was released by World Factbook in 2015 announced that 67.8% of Turkish GDP - composition was derived from Services (The World Factbook, 2016). Those situations can refresh Turkish economic growth after the lowest economic condition occurred.

Unfortunately, Turkey was too arrogant to face the international world. Turkey considers that nowadays, their economic growth is under control. They forget that international system nowadays is full of interdependence which a state needs others to fulfill their domestic needs. An accident finally happened when the Russia jet tried to buzz Ankara, it was shot by a Turkish army. Without

considering the impact of that wrongdoing, instead, Erdogan as the Turkish president refused to apologize to Russia since the Turkish army had warned Russia plane to move the direction 10 times. The survival pilot of Russia plane admitted that Turkish military gave no warning (Russia plans sanctions against Turkey over jet downing, 2015).

This situation actually disadvantage Turkish economic growth. Turkey should realize that Russia is actually their second biggest partner, and Russian is their biggest tourists who significantly visit Turkey each year. In 2014, 3.3 million visitors from Russia come to Turkey. Russia is also the biggest exporter of gas to Turkey. Around 55% of Turkish natural gas needs to be imported from Russia. If Russia stops to export their natural gas, it will be a serious problem for Turkey (Girit, 2016).

Turkey also has serious problem with its other ally, Israel. For Turkey, Russia and Israel are significant in maintaining the relations. But the accident of jet downing and Mavi Marmara ruined it. After the incident of Mavi Marmara when the Turkish volunteers brought humanitarian aid and were attacked by Israeli Police, Turkey cut their full diplomatic relations with Israel. This situation actually damaged Turkey since Turkey needed Israeli military and intelligence assistance.

These two great accidents which were impacted Turkish economy did not hold out for the long term conditions. Finally, Turkish President Recep Tayyip Erdogan apologized for the downing of a Russian military jet in 2016. He texted

President Vladimir Putin to express his sympathy and condolence toward the accident. On the other side, Turkey and Israel agreed to restore their full diplomatic relations after Israel agreed some conditions proposed by Turkey. This situation made the domestic economy of Turkey return normal again.

4. Decision Making Process in Turkey

The decision making process of a state is usually considered by many aspects and actors. Economic, social, culture, politic, and military are the examples of the aspects which often influence the decision making process of a state. Besides those aspects, the republic parliamentary political system as Turkey usually makes the decision making of the state considered by the government and Parliament as the actors which run Turkish government system.

Turkey is conducting parliamentary system as their government system. The head of the state is called as President while Turkish Prime Minister is the head of government. Turkey also recognizes direct vote which influences Turkish citizens to vote their representative in the parliament. There are 550 seats in Turkish parliament, Turkish Grand National Assembly (Álvarez-Rivera, 2015). The President of Turkey is voted by the members of Turkish Grand National Assembly. Then, the Turkish elected President points a Turkish Prime Minister from the member of Turkish Grand National Assembly. Finally, the Turkish Prime Minister chooses the Turkish ministers. The structure from President until Ministers is called as the Turkish Executive Branch which runs the government system. Turkish Grand National Assembly or Turkish Parliament is the

Legislative Branch which is one of its functions to give an approval of Turkish international treaty conducted by the Turkish Executive Branch (The Grand National Assembly of Turkey, 2010).

Every decision which is implemented by Turkish Executive Branch, especially foreign policy decision, must be agreed by Turkish Grand National Assembly. Including the restoration on full diplomatic relations between Turkey and Israel after the accident of Mavi Marmara, Turkish Executive Branch proposed a proposal about the restoration to Turkish parliament. The executive means the institution which plans and execute the state. Parliament means the balancer of executive which also means the representative of Turkish citizens. The consideration toward Turkish parliament is needed, because there must be people's role in creating decision.

On Turkey – Israel restorations, Turkish citizens were represented by their parliament in approving the normalization. The parliament was finally agreed on the restoration proposal given by the Turkish Executive Branch on August 19th, 2016 (Huaxia, 2016). Through this agreement, the restoration between Turkey and Israel was finally legalized by the Turkish constitution.

B. The Dynamics of Turkish Foreign Policy to Israel

1. The Root of Turkish Foreign Policy to Israel

The diversity of national interest of a state will influence how they conduct their foreign policy to others. A state will maintain their national interest in order to develop their domestic growth in term of social, economic, politics, military-

strategy and even culture. It is impossible for a state to make a decision of their foreign policy without considering their needs to other states. Decision makers of a state will never let their own state to be a disadvantage by implementing their foreign policy to others. It is a must for the decision makers to prioritize their national interest to fulfill the needs of their life in conducting their foreign policy.

Every state has its own way to make decision of their foreign policy. The model of the state system and governmental system of a state has big role in implementing the decision making process. A state which uses monarchy absolute has different way in making the decision of their foreign policy compared to the republic. It also happens in the scale of governmental system. If a state uses democracy in their governmental system, it cannot be compared how they make the decision with a state which using communist system. Turkey and Israel are also states which have difference in term of state and governmental system.

The relation which is conducted by Turkey and Israel is a unique example in which the different ideological backgrounds of those states do not become barricade for both states to have a good relations. Turkey is a state where muslim majority live in that state. Jews becomes the main majority of Israeli people beliefs to be followed. The first time relations conducted by both states were full of controversy in 1948, and it was also the first time Israel got their independence from Britain.

Turkey played two roles in constructing a relation with Israel. The first role, Turkey can ensure the Islamic states that Turkey is still a part of muslim world.

The second role, Turkey can reach the relations with Israel as their interest willing. In making the relations with Israel, Turkey focuses on military, strategic, and economy. This is an important thing for Turkey to have relations with Israel because Israel has the best quality of military, strategy, and intelligence. Moreover, Turkey sees Israel as a new born state which needs other state to have the relations in order to strengthen Israeli political condition.

The needs of Turkey to reach its relations toward Israel are reflected by Turkish founding father, Mustafa Kemal Atatürk who introduced Peace at Home, Peace in the World policy to Turkey. The foreign policy conducted by Turkey must be derived from the characteristic of Turkey as democratic, secular, and social state (Republic of Turkey Ministry of Foreign Affairs, 2011).

Talking about secularism in Turkey, it cannot be separated from military, strategy, and intelligence power of Turkey. There are some reasons why military power is dominant in Turkey. Firstly, considering the history of Turkey, this state has never been colonized, but instead, Turkey had colonized some states by their military power. Secondly, strategic needs oblige Turkey to always prepare its Military since the area of Turkey is strategic where power states are around. Thirdly, USA's interest to back up Turkish military power also becomes the logic reason why military power is really needed in this state. Fourthly, military becomes the safeguard for Turkey to prevent this country from domestic and International enemies (Burak, 2011).

2. Turkish Foreign Policy to Israel after Israel – Arab War in 1967

The core of conflict between Israel and Arabian world actually had occurred since the United Nations partition plan in November, 1947 which the land of Palestine should be shared into two sides. Jews state got 56% of the land, and Palestine got the rest (Beinin & Hajjar). This situation cannot be accepted by Arabian world because they consider that the land is Palestine's. The voted that won Jews state made Palestine lose its majority land. It disadvantaged Palestinians since they have to move from their land.

A year after the announcement of United Nations partition plan, Israel proclaimed its independent in 1948. This situation made the tension among those conflicting parties increased rapidly. USA and USSR aggravated the situations by recognizing Israel as the sovereign state. Meanwhile, the main issue between Israel and Palestine was not overcome yet. Shortly, the war cannot be avoided between Israel and Arabian world.

In 1967, Israel and Arabian world warred again for six days. The emerging issue of this war was the same with their war in 1948. This war actually was the continuation of the unsatisfied result on the United Nations partition plan. The tension was getting worst since the Arabian world intended to attack Israel and this issue was known by the Israeli intelligence (Schulze, 1999). Knowing the situation that Egypt and its ally would attack, Israel attacked the center port of Egyptian air force. This strategy was to demolish Egyptian troops which had

sophisticated technology at that time. Therefore, the six-war between Israel versus Arabian world which was led by Egypt could not be restrained.

Realizing the battle conditions between Israel and Arabian world which took place until three times battleship, Turkey gave their response for this third war toward Israel. Turkish Prime Minister at that time, Demirel reacted, "I am against annexing territory by force. If that door is opened, there will be no end to it" (2015, p. 7) Moreover, he knew that the problem for the last war was not only about Egypt plan to attack Israel, but also Israel expanded their area into Palestine territory. Turkey also gave strong reaction by "demanded [Israel] withdraw its armed forces from the occupied territories and pay compensation to the Arab countries" (Sekulow, 2015, p.7). This situation made the relations between Turkey and Israel decreased. Turkey showed their loyalty toward muslim world by protesting Israeli action.

Actually, Turkey – Israel friction on both states' relations took place in 1956 for the first time. In this year, Turkey downgraded the relations with Israel due to the conflict between Israel and Egypt about Suez Canal. In the middle – east region, water is like diamond in which every state really needs it for their survival. So does Israel which wants to empower this Canal. It seemed like Israel had willingness to occupy other states' natural resource. Israel occupied Palestine for the land, and they also did the same to Egypt for their Canal. In responding this problem, Turkey decided to downgrade their level of diplomatic with Israel in the level of chargé d'affaires, and it maintained until 1980s (Akgün, Gündoğar , & Görgülü, 2014).

3. Turkish Foreign Policy to Israel in the Era of Justice and Development Party's (Adalet Ve Kalkinma Partisi – AKP) Power

After the chargé d'affaires level of diplomatic between Turkey and Israel took place until 1980s, both states increased their level of diplomatic into the minister level in 1985s even if this diplomatic tie was not twined formally. Starting from this decision, the relations between Turkey and Israel increased rapidly in 1991 when for the first time, both state exchanged their ambassadors. These situations were maintained by both parties until 2000s due to there was new power in Turkey and Israel domestic politics.

The rise up of Justice and Development Party's (Adalet Ve Kalkinma Partisi – AKP) into power in Turkish political field influenced Turkish domestic and international politics. It had been long-time for Turkish political arena to be empowered by their military. AKP became the new emerging political power in Turkey in 2000s and broke the military tradition in empowering Turkey. Even though Turkish domestic and international political dimension changed from western to eastern states, Turkey – Israel relations was not influenced. Instead, the relations between both states getting tight (Israeli, 2001).

AKP is well known as Turkish party which always protests for Israeli military operations in Gaza. Although firstly, there was no problem about the domestic political change in both states, slow but sure, the relations between Turkey and Israel decreased slowly. This situation was worsened by Turkish Prime Minister at that time, Recep Tayyip Erdoğan criticized Israeli President Shimon Peres of

Israel military operation in Gaza. Moreover, he stated this statement in International formal forum, World Economic Forum in Davos (Volfová, 2014).

Finally, the downgrade of full diplomatic relations between Turkey and Israel broke up in 2010 following Mavi Marmara accident. This incident took place when Turkish humanitarian aid would be sent to Gaza. Israel authority implements Standard Operation for each humanitarian aid which will pass the blockade must be screened. The screening is a must for Israel because of the minimization of Military aids from outside. This procedure cannot be accepted by Turkish volunteers which raised a conflict. Unfortunately, ten Turkish volunteers were shot by Israeli Military. Erdogan rapidly responded this phenomenon by cutting their full diplomatic relations with Israel. But in 2016, six years after the accident of Mavi Marmara, both states agreed to restore their full diplomatic relations.