

Chapter Four

Findings and Discussion

In this chapter, the researcher presents the findings and discussion of the research. The research question is “What are the techniques used to do paraphrasing in annotated bibliography assignment by the students at EED of UMY batch 2013”. The findings are followed by the discussion.

Findings and Discussion

The data sources of this research were gathered from the documentation from students’ pair-work in writing annotated bibliography assignment from class Academic Presentation batch 2013. After collecting the data, the researcher analyzed and categorized the paraphrasing based on the techniques by Madnani and Dorr’ in 2010 study stated that there are three major techniques in paraphrasing: lexical paraphrase, phrasal paraphrase and sentential paraphrase. Then, the researcher consulted the data to the expert in order to get judgment related to the validity of the data analysis.

Here, the researcher presents the results into tables. There were three tables represent the techniques of paraphrasing based on the study by Madnani and Dorr. Each table displays the preference of techniques in paraphrasing used by students at EED of UMY batch 2013 in Academic Presentation class. It means the researcher use tables to explain the most used techniques for paraphrasing from the sub-parts that include in annotated bibliography such as the purposes, the methodology and the findings (Emerson, Rees, & MacKay, 2005). Overall, the

researcher explains the techniques that students mostly use for paraphrasing also discuss how students use those techniques.

Students' preference of techniques used in paraphrasing for annotated bibliography assignment

The researcher found out about the students' preference to the techniques used for doing paraphrasing in annotated bibliography assignment by students' batch 2013 in Academic Presentation class. There are three techniques of paraphrasing based on the study by Madnani and Dorr (2010) as following: lexical paraphrase, phrasal paraphrase and sentential paraphrase. After analyzing the data, the researcher can imply that students in Academic Presentation class batch 2013 have preference to use sentential paraphrase as the technique to do paraphrasing in annotated bibliography assignment. From 20 annotated bibliography assignments and journals related, there are 29 times when students' used sentential phrases in parts of annotated bibliography. The part in which the students preferred use sentential technique is methodology in annotated bibliography.

The researcher also presents the preference from the three parts of annotated bibliography. The first is in the purpose part, the participants mostly use phrasal technique to do paraphrasing. There are about ten times those participants implements phrasal paraphrase as the techniques in paraphrasing. Second is in the methodology part, the participants mostly use sentential technique to do paraphrasing. There were about twelve times the participants' implements sentential paraphrases as the techniques in paraphrasing. Third is in the findings

part, the participants mostly use sentential technique to do paraphrasing. The uses of sentential technique in findings part are eleven times.

From the three findings which discuss about the lexical, phrasal and sentential, students tend to use sentential paraphrase. There were some reasons why the students tend to implement sentential paraphrase. First, the documentation is gathered from students in University level batch 2013 then the students were experienced to write and practice some academic assignment included annotated bibliography. Second, the preference frequency of sentential paraphrase technique in EED of UMY batch 2013 students' may occurred because some students are found to easily do paraphrase in sentences rather than word or phrase form. This findings from the study occurred by Madhavi (2013) discussed that students often doing sentential paraphrase in order to ensure the good understanding of the part from the discussion. Moreover, in order to make sure the understanding of the part from the content or text, students may expand the details information easily in the form of sentences from the main idea of the information.

Students' lexical paraphrase technique in annotated bibliography assignment

In this section, the researcher explains the preference and how students applied lexical paraphrase technique in writing annotated bibliography based on the sub-parts which included in annotated bibliography assignment. The sub-parts are the purposes, the methodology and the findings. From the analysis between annotated bibliography assignment and journals related to the topic, students tend to use lexical paraphrase in the methodology and findings parts of annotated bibliography. The data showed that approximately 4 times students implemented

the lexical technique in methodology also findings. The purpose part is the least section which implemented the lexical paraphrase technique. Table 2.1 represent the use of lexical paraphrase technique in annotated bibliography and how students apply the technique.

Table 2.1 Lexical Paraphrase use in Annotated Bibliography Assignment

No	Annotated Bibliography Part	Journal Sentences	AB sentences	Lexical Paraphrases
1	Purpose on Journal & AB 1	There are several factors influencing the pronunciation of the L2 learners.	The researchers also explore some factors influencing English from the objective factors.	Use synonym
2	Methodology on Journal & AB 2	A mixed-methods approach was used to obtain the data	Mixed research methods were applied in obtaining data.	Using synonym
3	Findings on Journal & AB 4	Because the media are not available, while 30% claimed that they were very costly and unaffordable.	It is because the instructional media for teaching and learning of English as a second language were not available, accessible and expensive.	Participant use hypernymy technique/expression that can be changed
4	Purpose	The purpose of this study is to investigate the effects of comic	The paper focused on to investigate the effects of	Using synonym

		strips on reading comprehension of Turkish EFL learners.	comic on reading comprehension of Turkish EFL learners.	
5	Methodology on Journal & AB 5	The participants of the study were 167 students enrolled at Anadolu University School of Foreign Languages (AUSFL).	The participants from this paper were 167 students at Anadolu University School of Foreign Languages (AUSFL).	Using synonym to paraphrase the words
6	Findings on Journal & AB 9	Negative feedback or silence disturbs students. They are not able to work properly as they are not given proper guidance from the teacher. Since feedback makes classroom culture and environment more knowledgeable,	Nevertheless, the rest of them say that the feedback only gives a burden for them to learn since the teacher does not give clear and proper direction which should be followed by the students in order to comprehend the feedback.	Use variation diction

		<p>It is recommended that teachers may provide timely feedback to the learners so that they may be able to work properly.</p>	<p>The result suggests the reader, being a teacher, a teacher is supposed to consider how to create good and precise guideline to be followed by the students in understanding the feedback.</p>	<p>Use hypernymy</p>
7	<p>Methodology on Journal & AB 10</p>	<p>A total of 1,636 ninth grade students and their corresponding 83 science teachers participated in the study. Two questionnaires were developed and used for this study, one for students and one for teachers.</p>	<p>This research uses regression method. The study conducted in Muscat public schools in Oman. The participants of this study are 1,636 ninth-grade students and their 83 science teachers. 735 are males' student and 901 are females' student. 37 are males' teacher, and 46 are females' teacher. The measurements of this study use 2 methods. There is the teaching experience of the teachers ranged from 1 to 13.5 years</p>	<p>Similarity mean with rearrange words</p>

			with an average of 5.20 and a standard deviation of 2.64.	
8	Methodology on Journal & AB 14	The data are derived from the 1993 National Survey of College Graduates (NSCG) from the National Science Foundation.	Quantitative data of this research has taken from the 1993 National Survey of College Graduates (NSCG) from the National Science Foundation.	Synonym technique used
9	Findings on Journal & AB 14	The match between workers' schooling and jobs has been the focus of considerable research. Prior research has focused on the match between the quantity of schooling and years of schooling required for the job.	The result from this research are fifty-five percent of individuals report that their work and field of study are closely related, while 25% report that they are somewhat related	Participant use synonym
10	Findings on Journal & AB 17	The results indicated that the textbooks are not acceptable from the teachers' point of view considering their five sections, their physical make-up, and	As the result only "Grammar" category which was acceptable and the other of aspect in those English language textbooks did not encounter	Use synonym

		some practical concerns.	the teachers' expectation.	
11	Purpose on the Journal & AB 18	Sari. Jati Endah , B. Nuhung , Hastinie (2013) investigated the correlation between students ability in listening to the English songs and their vocabulary mastery	The aim of this research was to find out the correlation between students' ability in listening to the English songs and their vocabulary mastery. This research was conducted at SMA Negeri 1 Palu.	Use synonym

From the table, it showed that the participants used lexical paraphrase technique for writing annotated bibliography assignment in sub-parts such as purpose, methodology and findings. The table also displays the application of using lexical paraphrase technique which used by the participants.

First, students' tends to do paraphrasing in lexical technique with replacing the words with synonym. It takes place on purpose, methodology and findings parts. Synonym was used when the contextual similarity obtained from the corpus between any two content words (Yamamoto, 2002). For example in the findings on Journal & AB 14: schooling and jobs has the same meaning with work and field of study. Second, the participants do rearrangement of the word with similarity meaning, it happens on methodology part. For example in methodology on Journal & AB 10: A total of 1,636 ninth grade students have same meaning with the participants of this study are. Third, there is hypernymy or expression

that can be changed which participants' uses for paraphrasing with lexical technique. It is used in findings part. For example in Findings on Journal & AB 9: is recommended has same meaning with is supposed. Last, the results also show variation diction is used by the participants to do paraphrasing for findings part.

Based on the findings above, the participants implemented the lexical techniques in the all parts of annotated bibliography with several approaches. Those approaches belong to the lexical paraphrase technique. It can be looked back to the some studied done by experts such as Zhao, Liu, Yuan, Li & Zhang (2007) mentioned that lexical paraphrase has aim to acquire paraphrases with the similarity meaning or synonym. Also those several approaches are supported by Yamamoto (2002) said that for those words that cannot be replaced with find out the similarity meaning, there is hypernymy. So, it can be accepted for the participants who use synonym and hypernymy to do paraphrasing in annotated bibliography assignment.

In order to gather the same meaning of the word, some students mostly use synonym in paraphrasing area. Synonym is seen as the easiest way to find the similarity meaning between the words without being accused in plagiarism issue. Student can slightly modify the words by looking to the dictionary or the electronic gadget to see the similarity of the words. Moreover, some students at EED of UMY batch 2013 used lexical paraphrase followed with some reasons. First, they found out implemented synonym can avoid the plagiarism easily but they don't go further to the coherence and cohesive for the appropriate replacing of the words. Second, some students also used synonym which have tendency to

be seen that they do variation of the diction techniques in writing annotated bibliography assignment.

Students' phrasal paraphrase technique in annotated bibliography assignment

In this part, the researcher explains the preference and how students applied phrasal paraphrase technique in writing annotated bibliography based on the sub-parts which included in annotated bibliography assignment. The same implementation also occurred in the phrasal paraphrase techniques; it applied in parts of annotated bibliography called as purposes, the methodology and the findings. The researcher analyzed the documents from students' pair work in Academic Presentation class showed that the participants who applied phrasal technique of paraphrasing had preference to implied in the purpose part. The frequency in the used of phrasal are mentioned as 9 times in the purpose, 4 times in the methodology and 5 times in the findings. The totals of implementation for lexical paraphrase were 18 times. It means, the participants showed the preference of doing paraphrasing in phrasal paraphrase technique is in the purpose part. For the methodology and findings are the least parts of using phrasal paraphrase technique. Table 2.1 represent the use of phrasal paraphrase technique in annotated bibliography and how students apply the technique.

Table 3.1 Phrasal Paraphrase use in Annotated Bibliography Assignment

	Annotated Bibliography Part	Journal Sentences	AB sentences	Phrasal Paraphrases

1	Purpose on Journal & AB 2	This article focuses on the challenges faced by teachers of English to young learners against the backdrop of the global rise of English.	Copland, Garton, and Burns (2014) investigated the challenges in teaching English to young learners faced by English teachers around the world.	Participants input the different sentences with the same information
2	Methodology on Journal & AB 2	Including was completed by 4,459 teachers worldwide, and case studies, including observations and interviews with teachers , in five different primary schools in five different countries.	An online survey was completed by 4,459 English teachers worldwide, as well as case studies, including observations and interviews were done with teachers in five different primary schools from five different countries.	Same information
3	Findings on Journal & AB 2	The small classes' factor shows considerable variation against the global survey and among the five countries.	This study provides perspectives and data globally, involving a number of countries within the study, and locally in five different countries which represents five continents.	Retains the same information

4	Purpose on Journal & AB 3	This study intended to investigate the effects of authentic materials on vocabulary acquisition in International English Language Testing System (IELTS) students of Kimiya-e-Danesh institute, Yasuj, Iran.	To know the effect of authentic material toward vocabulary acquisition in International English Language Testing System (IELTS) students of Kimiya-e-Danesh institute, Yasuj, Iran	Participant implement key-phrase
5	Findings on Journal & AB 3	By using the authentic materials, and using an observation and questionnaires, the results show that most of the students' attitudes towards the use of authentic English language materials are positive and they enjoy learning	The result of this study is most of the students prefer to learn by using authentic material for vocabulary acquisition. Furthermore, using authentic material in learning process make the students enjoy in learning process	Involving key-phrase
6	Methodology on Journal & AB 4	The data collected were analyzed using descriptive statistics and with the use of simple percentages.	Descriptive statistics and simple percentages was used to analyze the collected data of this research study	Participant rearrange the sentences form
7	Findings on Journal & AB 5	The findings of this study revealed that all students with a comic strip effect, regardless of proficiency	It was revealed that all of students that use comic as reading had their proficiency and text level	Participants include the key-phrase

		and text level, performed better than the ones without the comic strips.	performed better than the ones without the comic as a reading.	
8	Purpose on Journal & AB 7	This study was designed to investigate (1) the difficulties faced by EFL university students with section two of the ITP, and (2) whether part A or part B was more difficult for them and why.	Rizki Ananda (2016) investigated the difficulties faced by EFL University students with section two of the ITP on TOEFL test in structure and written sections. And analyzes from structure and written part was more difficult and why	Same information is whether the sentence form is different
9	Purpose on the Journal & AB 9	Present study explores impact of teacher's feedback on learner's behavior at university level. Major objective of this research was to investigate how much learner's behavior at university level was affected by teacher's feedback.	This aim of this journal is to study teachers' feedback towards students' behavior in university level, the participants on this research comprise of many faculties such as science faculty, literature faculty, science graduate and prospective teacher	Using key-phrase
10	Methodology on the Journal & AB 9	A questionnaire was designed and given to the students to observe impact of teacher's feedback on them and how it brings	To gather the data, this research uses a questionnaire to observe the effect of teachers' feedback towards students' behavior.	Retains the same information

		behavioral change among them. The respondents comprised of learners from social science, language and literature, science graduates and prospective teachers	The method that used in this research is researcher observed the participant personally.	
11	Findings on the Journal & AB 9	Respondents showed that positive feedback from teachers at all levels acts as motivational force.	The result of this research shows that half of the participants argue if they can accept positive impact of the teacher as it can give them stimulus to learn.	Participant explain the same assumption
12	Purpose on the Journal & AB 10	this study sought to find out what student and class characteristics are related to students' perceptions of the classroom assessment environment	The purpose of this study is to inspect the influence of assessment practice on students' achievement goals.	Use key-phrase
13	Purpose on the Journal & AB 13	The developing use of a dictionary has the potential to provide self-teaching opportunities to improve reading, spelling and general phonological skills.	Beech, John R. (2004) investigated the use of dictionary to find out patterns using dictionary, skill and frequency using dictionary and the relationship between these and reading, spelling and phonological Development	Participant include the relevance information

	Purpose on the Journal & AB 14	This paper examines the match between a worker's schooling and job by considering whether the field of study in college is related to the current job.	The purpose of this research is to consider the relationship between college majors and occupations	Retain same information
	Purpose on the Journal & AB 15	The purpose of the present study is to examine the effects of feedback and revision on the writing of Japanese EFL learners.	Nakanishi (2007) perceives about the effect of different types of feedback on revision. Nonetheless, Nakanishi only focuses on how a teacher offers a feedback in writing context.	Use key-phrase
14	Purpose on the Journal & AB 17	The purpose of this study is to evaluate the three English language textbooks currently used at high schools in Iran from the high school English teachers' point of view.	Hence, Rahimpour and Hashemi (2011) conducted this study to evaluate the three of English language textbook currently used at high school in the perceptive of high school English teachers	Rearrangement with the same information
15	Methodology on the Journal & AB 18	The population was the eleventh grade students consisting of 202 students. The sample was 20 students taken randomly. The instruments were tests which consisted of listening and	The population was the eleventh grade students consisting of 202 students from SMA Negeri 1 Palu and the sample was 20 students taken randomly.	Using key-phrase

		vocabulary, and non-test of questionnaire.		
16	Purpose on the Journal & AB 19	This research paper was conducted to find out the effects of authentic materials on students learning at elementary level.	The purpose of this study was to examine elementary school teachers' perceptions on the use of one or many of authentic materials as a tool in students' interest in reading and writing in English as foreign language	Same component which retain the same information
17	Findings on the Journal & AB 19	The results of data shows that the authentic materials are a good and useful tool for learning a second language toward examination purposes because they lead the learner into drawing out language from their own knowledge and personal experiences through exposure to, immersion to the stimuli presented before them.	The result is 95% most of the teachers agree about the used of authentic materials in the classroom. It is because they think that authentic materials are easy to understand and make both students and teachers are more creative to prepare their attitude in learning process.	Using key-phrase
18	Methodology on the Journal & AB 20	The present study aimed to explore the rhetorical moves of	The researcher used investigation to collecting the data. A total of	Use key-phrase

		abstracts in the fields of linguistics and applied linguistics by investigating 200 abstracts published between 2009-2012.	200 research article abstract from three selected journals in the field of linguistics.	
--	--	--	---	--

The table above presented the participants were applied phrasal paraphrase technique for writing the purpose, methodology and purpose which are the parts of annotated bibliography assignment. Participants also directed several ways to conduct the phrasal technique in those parts of annotated bibliography. There were several approaches to do paraphrasing from the findings uses phrasal technique. First, the participants mentions about implementing key-phrase from the sentence. Purpose on the Journal & AB 15: examine the effects of feedback and revision on the writing involved the key-phrase in perceives about the effect of different types of feedback on revision. Second, there is retaining the same information from the different phrase. For example, Methodology on the Journal & AB 9: A questionnaire was designed and given to retains the same information with To gather the data, this research uses. Only a few students who use the same assumption from phrase to be implemented in the approach for paraphrasing.

It can be seen from those several approach such as retain the same information, involving key-phrase are adopted from the study by Zhang et al. (2011) which proposed that retain the same information and involve key-phrase as the approach in paraphrasing the phrase.

The implementation of phrasal techniques as the second preference by students at EED of UMY in doing paraphrasing in annotated bibliography assignment may happen because of some conditions. Phrasal paraphrase technique can be occurred with involved the key-phrase approach of the information which mostly some students implemented that approach. Involving key-phrase are happened because students want to replace the information without changing the very core of the information, they want to put the important information while keeping the source of information.

Students' sentential paraphrase technique in annotated bibliography assignment

The findings for this section are categorized on the two main points. First, the researcher mentioned about the part of students' preferences when applied the sentential paraphrase technique. Second, the researcher discussed about how students applied the sentential paraphrase technique. Same as the previous findings, the sentential techniques occurred in the parts of annotated bibliography: purpose, methodology and findings.

From the documents of annotated bibliography and journal topic-related in Academic Presentation class, the participants showed the preference of doing paraphrasing with sentential techniques. In most frequency implementation of using lexical technique are 5 times in the purpose, 12 times in the methodology and 11 times for findings part. There were 29 times when the participants applied sentential paraphrase technique. Moreover, it can be concluded that methodology

is the most part which preferences by students' to applied sentential technique.

The least preference to applied sentential techniques is in the purpose part.

Table 4.1 represent the use of sentential paraphrase technique in annotated bibliography and how students applied the technique.

Table 4.1 Sentential Paraphrase use in Annotated Bibliography Assignment

No	Annotated Bibliography Part	Journal Sentences	AB sentences	Sentential Paraphrases
1	Methodology on Journal & AB 1	A number of studies have found that English spoken by different Chinese dialect... (Bolton & Kwok, 1990)	This study the researcher used library research method. This method, the researcher chosen some resources that found it. There are resources from websites, journals and books	Participants clearly do summarizing based on the reading and did not doing paraphrasing.
2	Findings on Journal & AB 1	Some Chinese students tend to have difficulty with English sounds because they are deeply influenced by similar Chinese sounds	The researcher found some the problem in pronunciation of English learners in China.	Participants do paraphrase use sentence simplification approach
3	Findings on Journal & AB 1	Pronunciation instruction tends to be linked to the instructional method being used. In the grammar-translation method of the past,	This study found that the instructional methods are the grammar-translation method and the audio-lingual method to use in the	Participants use sentence simplification

		pronunciation was almost irrelevant and therefore seldom taught. In the audio-lingual method, learners spent hours in the language lab listening to and repeating sounds and sound combinations.	pronunciation practice	
4	Findings on Journal & AB 2	In the UAE, where most classes are relatively small (20+), it was ranked first. Global response, motivation and discipline were also mentioned. Colombian teachers mainly appear concerned about developing productive skill and lack of resources to assist them	This study also suggests how policy in different countries affects English teaching aspect which can be used as considerations for Education teachers to prepare and suit English teaching and learning progress.	Participant paraphrase the sentence use expanding explanation approach
5	Methodology on Journal & AB 3	In this study a homogeneous sample of 50 students was selected from a population of IELTS students studying at Kimiyay-e-Danesh institute, Yasuj, Iran. The subjects of the study were adults above 25.	This research use quantitative research and regression measurement. The researcher use random sampling for choosing the participants. The first step is that the researcher did the observation to 50 participants. After that, the researcher distributed the	Explaining the data collection use statistical word alignment method

			questionnaire for 50 participants.	
6	Purpose on Journal & AB 4	The author of this paper describes the effect of the apt selection and use of instructional media on the teaching and learning of English as a second language in secondary schools.	The research study aims at highlighting the reason of secondary school teacher in selecting appropriate educational media and the effect on using the instructional media on teaching and learning of English as a second language in secondary school.	Participant describes in more detail with expanding explanation approach
7	Methodology on Journal & AB 5	The participants were placed in the elementary, lower-intermediate, intermediate, upper-intermediate, or advanced groups.	The students divided into four groups of lower-intermediate and four groups of upper intermediate students.	Participants use expanding explanation
8	Purpose on Journal & AB 6	This study investigates the impact of portfolio assessment as a process-oriented assessment mechanism on Iranian EFL students' English writing ability.	This research was discussed about the portfolio assessment and the students' writing skill. The aim of this study is to investigate the impact of portfolio assessment as a process – oriented assessment mechanism on Iranian EFL students' English writing ability.	The assumption between two sentences are precise and use term variant identification

9	Methodology on the Journal & AB 6	<p>Sixty one students of similar writing ability were chosen as the participants of this study. They were divided into two groups. The experimental group received the treatment i.e. portfolio assessment while the control group underwent the traditional assessment.</p>	<p>The participants of this research were 61 undergraduate students who divided into two groups based on the writing test. 30 students were the experimental group and 31 students were the control group. Both of the experimental and control groups were given the pre and post-test. The method that is used in this research was quasi-experimental design, while the instruments that are used in this research were writing test and interview.</p>	<p>Statistical words alignment method</p>
10	Findings on the Journal & AB 6	<p>The findings suggest that portfolio assessment empowers students' learning of English writing, hence emphasizing the formative potential of portfolio assessment in EFL classes. Also, the students in the portfolio assessment group outperformed the</p>	<p>The first result is that the students' overall essay writing ability was affected by the portfolio assessment. Furthermore, the second result is that the portfolio assessment has positive effect on the students' writing ability in terms of focus, elaboration, organization and vocabulary</p>	<p>Participants use terms variant identification</p>

		students in the control group in their overall writing ability and in the sub-skills of focus, elaboration, organization and vocabulary.		
11	Methodology on the Journal & AB 7	A number of 26 students from two different universities, Syiah Kuala University and the State Islamic University Ar-Raniry were the samples for the test. The data was obtained from a multiple choice questionnaire test consisting of 46 questions, each with 4 answers to choose from.	26 English students from Syiah Kuala University National Islamic University Ar-Raniry were taken the actual TOEFL test. The respondents were taken by using random sampling and for the instruments using test and questionnaire items. Then the data were analyzed through several stages, from checking the answer until percentages it	Participant use expanding explanation method
12	Findings on the Journal & AB 7	The results showed that inversions (12%), subject-verb agreements (10%), adverb clause connectors (7%), passives (6%), reduced adjective clauses (5%), parallel structures (5%) and use of verbs (5%) were the	As a result all of the topics commonly included in section two of the ITP TOEFL test, there were seven topics which were the most difficult for the students	Statistical data became sentence simplification

		most difficult questions for the students.		
13	Purpose on the Journal & AB 8	Research into the effectiveness of the use of drama in the teaching of English as a second language (ESL) as opposed to traditional instructional methods, specifically to the enhancement of the oral skills, including pronunciation and fluency, was undertaken in this study	The research aims to highlight the effects of the use of drama as a means of improving the students' oral skills for pronunciation and fluency, compared to the traditional teaching methods utilized for this purposes in the classroom	Participants use sentence simplification method
14	Methodology on the Journal & AB 8	The students assessed were Spanish mother tongue speakers and attended a public school in Madrid, Spain. Two classes from the same year group received instruction in the differing methods over a three-week period. They were examined pre and post instruction and an analysis of the results is provided below. Data was collected and analyzed using a two-tailed t-test for two independent	The quantitative research was carried out in a public school in Madrid, Spain. The students of 9 th grade with 20 students each class were the sample of this research. Data was collected primarily by means of a two-group pre-test/post-test quasi experimental design. Both of groups had the same time of English instruction in three days a week. While, the researcher gave the treatment in intervention group	Participant use compression and expanding explanation method

		samples with equal variance to examine whether either method was more effective	and the control group has been instructed by the teacher.	
15	Methodology on the Journal & AB 10	A total of 1,636 ninth grade students and their corresponding 83 science teachers participated in the study. Two questionnaires were developed and used for this study, one for students and one for teachers.	This research uses regression method. The study conducted in Muscat public schools in Oman. The participants of this study are 1,636 ninth-grade students and their 83 science teachers. 735 are males' student and 901 are females' student. 37 are males' teacher, and 46 are females' teacher. The measurements of this study use 2 methods. There is the teaching experience of the teachers ranged from 1 to 13.5 years with an average of 5.20 and a standard deviation of 2.64.	Use statistical alignment method
16	Findings on the Journal & AB 10	Students' perceptions of the assessment environment were shaped by student characteristics such as self-efficacy; class contextual features such as	The result of this study has there interacted significantly between class contextual features and teachers' teaching experiences and assessment practices and	Use sentence simplification method

		aggregate perceived assessment environment and average self-efficacy levels of the class; teacher's teaching experience and assessment practices; and interaction of student characteristics, class contextual features, and teacher's assessment practices.	students' characteristics in influencing students' achievement goals.	
17	Purpose on the Journal & AB 11	The emphasis on accuracy is justified in the sense that it can lead to the production of structurally correct instances of second language, and to prevent inaccuracy that may result in the production of structurally erroneous sentences.	The purpose of this study is to emphasis on the accuracy students in writing, and it also to prevent the inaccuracy that may result in the production of structurally sentences.	Participant use simplifications in the sentence
18	Methodology on the Journal & AB 11	The study was conducted with 60 upper intermediate English students in an EFL context. In conducting a quasi-	This study was conducted with 60 upper intermediate English students who had the same level of grammar knowledge based on Cambridge Passages 2. The	Participant do compression approach

		experimental design, the present study aimed at investigation of the effectiveness of three error correction strategies	participants are ranged from 21 to 25 years old. The participants given by the 40 different type of test then they are divided into three different groups, those are 2 experimental groups and 1 control group.	
19	Findings on the Journal & AB 11	The findings of the study indicated that the participants who received 'indirect coded correction' feedback showed better performance compared to those who received 'indirect encoded error correction' or 'direct correction' feedback	The result of this study is the students who received the indirect coded are get higher test score than another two groups because they can do the autonomous learning.	Use sentence simplification
20	Purpose on the Journal & AB 12	The study investigates the premise that an ICT project where children read books and then use email communication to exchange responses with other learners will support critical thinking	Researcher was research Information and Communication Technology is have impact with the critical thinking of student. Using the observation, journals and rap sheets were analysed for individual	Participants do sentence simplification

			students' level of critical awareness.	
21	Findings on the Journal & AB 12	The present study aimed to explore the rhetorical moves of abstracts in the fields of linguistics and applied linguistics by investigating 200 abstracts published between 2009-2012. Hyland's (2000) model of five rhetorical moves was chosen as the analytical framework for the rhetorical structure.	The researcher used investigation to collecting the data. A total of 200 research article abstract from three selected journals in the field of linguistics.	Participants compressing the sentence
22	Methodology on the Journal & AB 15	The students were divided into four groups, depending on from whom they were given feedback. Forty students participated in this study. The participants were trained to give both self-feedback and peer-feedback in class. After writing first drafts, the students were given feedback in one of the four forms of feedback.	This research comprises forty students divided to be four groups. Every group acquires differently various comments, and the types of comments encompass of 1) Peer-feedback, 2) self-feedback, 3) teacher-feedback, and 4) peer teacher feedback.	Participant use compression in main topic

23	Findings on the Journal & AB 15	The result was that the scores of all groups became higher after each type of feedback , and there was no significant difference according to feedback types	As a result, the study sums up if there is no considerably significant difference among peer-feedback, self-feedback, teacher-feedback, and peer teacher feedback . Nakanishi states, if every type of feedback in evaluating students' work has certain benefit	Use expanding explanation
24	Methodology on the Journal & AB 16	This research is a quantitative research, so it needs a data analysis. The samples of this study are two classes. The first class is VIIIA as the control group and the second classes is VIIB as an experimental group. Both of classes consist of 32 students. The researcher uses purposive sampling because of some considerations.	This research is using quantitative research with an experimental method. The population of this research is 218 eight-grade student in year 2011/2012 but the researcher only focus on eight-grade students that divided into control group (32 students of VIII A) and experimental group (32 students of VIII B). The researcher used purposive sampling which means that the researcher must choose the two classes that are balance in English subject. The treatment was	Use expanding explanation

			given on first day (pre-test) and last day (pot-test).	
25	Findings on the Journal & AB 16	The result of this study shows that teaching writing by using picture series as media can improve the students' writing ability in recount text. Based on the result of post-test on two groups, the mean score of experimental group is 66.88. Meanwhile, the mean score of control group is 61.88. The result of the computation of t-value (t-test) is 2.35. The computation shows that t-value is higher than t-table that is $2.35 > 2.00$.	As a result, the data shows that the highest score in experimental group is 85 and the lowest is 50. The mean of experimental group is 66.88. On the other side, the highest score in control group is 80 and the lowest is 50. The mean of a control group is 61.88. Based on that data the computation shows that t-value is higher than t-table that is $2.35 > 2.00$. The researcher concludes that there is an effectiveness of using picture series toward students' writing ability in recount text	Participant rearrange the sentence form and use expanding statistical explanation
26	Methodology on the Journal & AB 17	46-item questionnaire was developed about the five sections of the textbooks (vocabulary, reading, grammar, language functions, and pronunciation practice), their physical make-up, and practical	There were 50 high school English teachers (20 male and 30 female) with more than 10 years of teaching experience as the participant in this study. After the questionnaires were piloted, those teachers would answer 46 items of	Use expanding explanation

		concerns. Fifty high school teachers with more than five years of teaching experience were asked to reflect on the questions by checking one of the four options included.	final questionnaire about different characteristics of the three high school English language textbooks	
27	Methodology on the Journal & AB 19	The researcher used qualitative method approach in which simultaneously collected data using a non-participant observation, artifacts, and face-to face interview.	This research conducted in the fall semester of 2013 using qualitative approach. The participants of this research were 64 English language teachers from 6 public schools which are 40 teachers from Kuwait and 24 come from Arab and the other nationalities	Participant use expanding explanation
28	Purpose on the Journal & AB 20	The previous studies on abstracts (e.g., Santos, 1996; Samraj, 2002; Pho, 2008) illustrate that disciplinary variation in research article abstracts is discernible. However, the studies of abstracts from two related disciplines are still limited.	This study's objective was to examine the rhetorical moves of abstracts in two closely related subjects; those are linguistics and applied linguistics	Use compression from the sentences

29	Findings on the Journal & AB 20	Findings indicated that there were three conventional moves in abstracts in linguistics, while there were four conventional moves in abstracts in applied linguistics. The findings have significant pedagogical implications for academic writing for novice writers in the two disciplines.	The findings of this study describe that the rhetorical move in linguistic change the pattern among writers to write abstract	Participants use sentence simplification
----	---------------------------------	---	---	--

Table 4.1 From the table above, it indicates that the participants are implements sentential paraphrase technique in writing annotated bibliography including the parts of the purpose, methodology and findings. The researcher also displays the approaches to implements the sentential technique in those parts of annotated bibliography. There are several approaches to do paraphrasing from the findings uses sentential technique. There are the approaches that used by the participants as following expanding explanation approach, sentence simplification approach, compression sentence approach, statistical word alignment method, terms variant identification approach, rearrange sentences and expanding statistical explanation. The participant tends to implements expanding explanation approach in purpose beside the methodology and findings parts. For example, are in the table Findings on the journal & AB 15: after each type of feedback become

more detail peer-feedback, self-feedback, teacher-feedback, and peer teacher feedback. The least approach for paraphrasing for sentential paraphrasing used is terms variant identification and rearrange sentence & expanding statistical explanation approaches.

From the results, participants are implements the sentential techniques in the all parts of annotated bibliography with several approaches. Those approaches are belongs to the sentential paraphrase technique based on the theories by the experts. The theory that came from Napoles, Burch, & Post (2011) were sentence simplification approach, grammatical error correction, compression and expanding multiple references. Further the study by Bouamor, Max, & Vilnat (2010) added more approaches to do paraphrasing in sentential technique such as statistical word alignment method and rearrange sentences and expanding statistical explanation.

The use of sentential paraphrase as the major technique of doing paraphrasing in annotated bibliography already discussed in the first finding which mentioned about some reasons of implemented sentential technique. For the additional, students may face the difficulty while implement the sentential paraphrase because the awkwardly forced for consisted meaning of the source information. They needed to assemble their own sentences in order to ensure that their sentences' paraphrasing is understandably. The study Liao and Tseng (2010) communicated that students may borrow the source information then doing inconsistent of describing the main idea of it.