

CHAPTER V
CLOSING
(SUMMARY, CONCLUSION, IMPLICATIONS
AND RECOMMENDATIONS)

This research paper sought to answer the following questions: 1) to what extent are performance expectancy, effort expectancy, social influence, facilitating conditions, anxiety and attitude associated with the behavioral intention of adopting e-government transformation in the cities of Surabaya, Indonesia and Davao, Philippines; and, 2) to what extent do the respondents' age and length of work experience moderate these associations? This study utilized a research model that critically analyzed the variables which are pivotal in the adoption of e-government transformation from the perspective of government employees in both cities. e-Government transformation is defined as involving four interrelated dimensions, i.e., new ICT systems (model 1), process redesign (model 2), organizational structuring (model 3), and cultural and behavioral change (model 4).

This part is a structured presentation of the following: summary of results on the respondents' demographic profile, and the associations of variables; conclusions drawn from the results; implications inferred from the conclusions; and, recommendations based on the implications.

5.1 Summary of Results

Demographic profile

In general, majority of the employees in both city governments are relatively young, but a considerable number are in the older age bracket. On the comparative level, majority of the Surabaya sample belong to the 21-45 age brackets, while a minority are in the 46-65 brackets. On the other hand, majority of the Davao sample belong to the 21-45 age brackets, while a minority are in the 46-65 age brackets. However, a comparison reveals that there are more Surabaya sample who are in the 21-45 age brackets than the Davao sample. Conversely, there are more Davao sample who are in the 46-65 age brackets than the Surabaya sample.

In general, majority of the respondents have longer work experience (11 years and more) in the city government. On the comparative level, majority of the Surabaya

sample have been working in the city government for ten years or less, while a minority of them have been in the city government service for 11 years and more. On the other hand, a minority of the Davao sample have been working in the city government for ten years or less, while a majority of them have been in the city government service for 11 years and more.

New ICT systems (model 1)

At the aggregate level, the study shows that in using new ICT systems for e-government transformation, attitude towards this behavioral intention is the pivotal variable, and that age and length of work experience do not appear as moderating variables.

Comparative results indicate that facilitating conditions and attitude are the crucial factors for using new ICT systems by the Davao city government employees. Moreover, their age appears to be strongly influencing positively the effect of anxiety on their intention to use new ICT systems, at the same it negatively influences the effects of effort expectancy and attitude. Length of work experience was also found out to negatively influence the effects of performance expectancy, effort expectancy, social influence and attitude on the intention to use new ICT systems. On the other hand, attitude seems to be the crucial factor for using new ICT systems by the Surabaya city government employees. Their age and length of work experience do not appear to influence in any manner the effects of predictor variables on the intention to use new ICT systems.

Process redesign (model 2)

At the aggregate level, the study shows that in adopting process redesign for e-government transformation, performance expectancy, social influence and attitude towards this behavioral intention are the pivotal variables. Age and length of work experience do not appear as moderating variables.

Comparative results indicate that performance expectancy and attitude are the pivotal variables which predict the intention of Davao and Surabaya city government employees to adopt process redesign. Age is shown to have a strong positive moderating effect on the influence of anxiety, and strong and moderate negative effects,

respectively, on the influence of effort expectancy and attitude on intention of Davao city government employees. Their length of work experience turns out to have strong negative moderating effects on the influence of performance expectancy, effort expectancy, social influence and attitude on intention to adopt process redesign. On the contrary, both age and length of work experience of Surabaya city government employees do not affect in any way the predictor variables of intention to adopt process redesign.

Organizational structuring (model 3)

At the aggregate level, the study shows that in adopting organizational structuring for e-government transformation, performance expectancy, facilitating conditions and attitude towards this behavioral intention are the pivotal variables. Length of work experience appear to moderately and strongly affect in the negative direction the influence of effort expectancy and attitude, respectively, on the intention to adopt organizational structuring.

Comparative results show that performance expectancy and attitude are the key factors which influence the intention of Davao and Surabaya city government employees to adopt organizational structuring. For Davao employees, age is found to have a strong positive influence the effect of anxiety on the behavioral intention. Length of work experience is also revealed to strongly influence negatively the effects of effort expectancy and social influence on intention to adopt organizational structuring. On the other hand, age and length of work experience do not seem to influence the effects of predictor variables on the intention of Surabaya employees to adopt organizational structuring.

Cultural and behavioral change (model 4)

At the aggregate level, the study shows that in adopting cultural and behavioral changes for e-government transformation, performance expectancy, facilitating conditions and attitude towards this behavioral intention are the pivotal variables. Age does not appear to have moderating effects. Length of work experience seem to strongly moderate in the negative direction the influence of performance expectancy, effort expectancy and attitude on the intention to adopt cultural and behavioral changes.

Comparative results show that in adopting cultural and behavioral change, attitude emerge as the crucial variable for Davao and Surabaya city government employees. Age of Davao employees turn up as negatively affecting the influence of effort expectancy, and positively affecting the influence of anxiety on the behavioral intention. Length of work experience strongly moderates in the negative direction the associations between effort expectancy, social influence, attitude and behavioral intention of Davao respondents. Age and length of work experience of Surabaya employees do not affect in any way the influence of predictor variables of intention to adopt cultural and behavioral change.

5.2 Conclusion

This study's main objective has been to critically analyze the extent of associations between performance expectancy, effort expectancy, social influence, facilitating conditions, anxiety, attitude and behavioral intention of local government employees to adopt e-government transformation. On the basis of the results presented in the previous section and as a conclusion, this study proposes a theory of e-government transformation adoption, which is graphically represented in a model (please see Figure 4.5, p. 132).

For the employees of both city governments, performance expectancy is a significant determinant factor for e-government transformation adoption. Social influence is a significant contributing factor for e-government transformation adoption. Facilitating conditions significantly influence government employees' intention to adopt e-government transformation. Attitude is a crucial factor for e-government transformation adoption. On the whole, effort expectancy and anxiety appear to be insignificant factors in e-government transformation adoption.

Comparatively, the Davao employees' age and length of work experience in the government experience strongly moderate the influences of the abovementioned variables' relationships with the behavioral intention to adopt e-government transformation. In other words, employees who are older and who have longer work experience in the organization tend to have issues with regard to adopting and using transformative practices and activities. On the other hand, Surabaya city government employees, young and old, with short or long work experience, do not appear to have

issues with e-government transformation adoption. This could perhaps partly explain why Surabaya is in its current state of e-government development.

5.3 Implications

Implications to theory

In the context of this study and from the city government employees' perspective, attitude is the pivotal variable in the intention to use new ICT systems for e-government transformation (model 1). This supports the argument that individuals perform behaviors towards which they have a positive affect (Ajzen and Fishbein 1980; Ajzen 1991; Davis 1989), especially in the use of new ICT systems in government (Nam 2012; Hung et al. 2013; Rana et al. 2015b). Performance expectancy, effort expectancy, social influence, facilitating conditions, and social influence do not emerge as predictors of this particular behavioral intention, thus not advancing support to the prevailing notions of many studies. This finding implies that city government employees in both cities already believe that using new ICT systems can or have already met their expectations in terms of performance and effort. Facilitating conditions are already present. External social factors and individual factors, such as anxiety, do not really matter much. Anxiety also does not come out as a predictor for intention of new ICT systems use, in a way undermining the claim of some studies (Meuter et al. 2003; Olatubosun and Rao 2012).

Performance expectancy, social influence, and attitude are pivotal predictors of the intention to adopt process redesign for e-government transformation (model 2). For this particular dimension, city government employees in both cities view positive impacts on performance and external factors as important reasons to adopt it. An interesting find in this aspect is that effort expectancy negatively influences the behavioral intention. In other words, some city government employees, particularly in Davao, believe that doing it would require more effort.

Performance expectancy, facilitating conditions and attitude come out as the pivotal predictors of the intention to adopt organizational structuring (model 3), and to adopt cultural and behavioral change for e-government transformation (model 4). Adopting both facets of transformational government is reckoned by city government

employees in both cities as valuable for improved performance. Facilitating conditions, i.e. financial, technical, structural, and political, must be present.

The findings support the generally validated models which report that performance expectancy, facilitating conditions, social influence (Lin and Liang, 2011; Carter, et al., 2012; Weerakkody, et al., 2013) and attitude (Rana, et al., 2016; Dwivedi, et al., 2017) are predictor variables of e-government adoption. Moreover, the findings actually extend the predicting power of such variables from the technological aspect of e-government to the process, organizational, cultural and behavioral dimensions of e-government.

In general, age as a moderating variable is not relevant in all four models, invalidating the claims of some studies (Venkatesh and Morris, 2000; Venkatesh, et al., 2003; AbuShanab and Pearson, 2007; Hamner and Al-Qahtani, 2009; Yu, 2012). However, an interesting find by this study is that length of work experience has significant relevance as a moderating variable. It has substantial negative effects on the relationships between effort expectancy, attitude and intention to adopt organizational structuring. It similarly affects the relationships between performance expectancy, effort expectancy, attitude and intention to adopt cultural and behavioral change. These negative moderating effects are very salient among Davao employees who have longer work experience in the city government. On the other hand, age and length of work experience does not in any way affect the Surabaya government employees.

This study has shown that the constructs' roles as predictors (attitude, performance expectancy, facilitating conditions, social influence) and moderator (length of work experience) of behavioral intention can be extended to other dimensions of e-government. This is the evident contribution of this research to the progression of e-government adoption literature: the examination and validation of those constructs' roles in the process, organizational, cultural and behavioral aspects of e-government.

Implications to practice

Attitude stand out as the crucial factor for the intention to adopt the four dimensions of e-government transformation. Thus, maintaining and sustaining the positive attitude about it among city government employees, especially those who have been in the government service for a longer period, is very important for its incremental

realization. For e-government transformation to be adoptable and efficacious, some conditions are necessary. Transforming so as to improve the city government's performance, hence become more effective and efficient, should always be instilled among the employees. The employees, the older ones in particular, should be made to understand that doing so requires additional effort on their part being members of the organization. Moreover, they should also be made to realize that while technology is rapidly improving, at the same time citizens' expectations of government service delivery are also rising and therefore adjustments have to be done. City government officials and decision-makers should see to it that financial, technical, and structural support are present, which necessitates sound political leadership and committed political will. The positive attitude towards the idea and practice of transformational government should be maintained and sustained among city government employees and officials.

5.4 Recommendations

For future research

Appropriate provisions have been carried out by the researcher in the conduct of this study, but certain limitations need to be considered with regard to the interpretation of its findings. First, the determination of the sample size was done through purposive sampling, so the application of results should be done with prudence. Future researchers must take note of the city government employee population size, so that if it is just a small and manageable size, then complete enumeration would be ideal. The result could then be safely generalized to the whole population. Second, the constructs used for the research model were chosen due to their prominence in the literature. Future researchers may consider investigating other variables, and developing constructs which are appropriate in the government organization context. Third, except for the constructs attitude and behavioral intention measures, which were derived from Davis et al. (1989), Fishbein and Ajzen (1975), and Venkatesh et al. (2003) respectively, the measures for all other constructs have been conceptualized by the researchers and should be considered as initial undertakings. Future researchers could frame other measures deemed to be appropriate for the constructs. Fourth, this study made use of a simple linear regression model in hypothesizing the relationships

of the constructs and therefore future research may develop research models that would explore some other nuances in the constructs' relationships.

For policy/decision-makers in government organizations or agencies

In view of the research results' implications to practice, the researcher proposes some feasible actions that must be done by the city government organizations or agencies which consider transformation of their e-government a priority.

Seminars and orientations that are designed to develop, maintain and sustain the right attitude of government employees towards adopting changes or reforms in the organization must be conducted regularly. This recommendation is specifically addressed to the Davao city government, mainly because of the finding that its older employees are found to have negative attitudes toward transformation. For the Surabaya city government, activities to sustain the positive attitude should be continued.

Strategic planning by each organization or agency in order to draw up short-term and long-term development plans should be consistently accomplished. Monitoring and evaluation of the plans' implementation should likewise be done.

Re-tooling and capacity-building activities for the employees are essential for the transformation process. Thus, workshops and in-house trainings on pertinent fields of organizational work facilitated by experts and professionals should be carried out. Again, this is highly recommended for the Davao city government.

Visits and exposures to government agencies or organizations with best e-government practices would be an excellent approach to make employees more well-informed. These could also be useful for benchmarking purposes, to serve as a guide for transformation efforts.

Finally, legislative actions by the local government are crucial for the facilitation of e-government transformation. In order to institutionalize transformational practices, local laws must be enacted. Executive orders must be issued. The legal framework for e-government transformation must be existent.