

**THE DISPUTE SETTLEMENT OF JOINT PROPERTY THROUGH
BANTUL RELIGIOUS COURT
PUBLICATION MANUSCRIPT**



Name : Leo Pernando
Student Number : 20140610515
Faculty : Law
Major : International Program for Law and Sharia
Field of Study : Civil Law

**FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITAS MUHAMMADIYAH YOGYAKARTA
2018**

APPROVAL PAGE

THE DISPUTE SETTLEMENT OF JOINT PROPERTY THROUGH BANTUL
RELIGIOUS COURT

Advisor I



M. Khaeruddin Hamsin, Ph.D., LL.M
NIK. 1960122920094153 053

Advisor II



H. Nasrullah, S.H., S.Ag., MCL
NIK. 1970061720004 153 045

Dean of Faculty of Law
Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta



Dr. Trisno Raharjo, S.H., M.Hum.
NIK. 19710409199702 153 028

THE DISPUTE SETTLEMENT OF JOINT PROPERTY THROUGH BANTUL RELIGIOUS COURT

By: Leo Pernando

International Program for Law and Sharia, Faculty of Law, Universitas
Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta, Brawijaya Street, Tamantirto, Kasihan, Bantul,
Yogyakarta, INDONESIA 55183

Email: pernandoleo3@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

Joint property still becomes one of the disputing issues after the dissolution of marriage in a Moslem family in Indonesia. This research aims at analyzing the legal status of joint property in Islamic Law and Indonesian Law as well as the settlement its disputes at the Religious Court of Bantul. This research is a qualitative research using case approach. Thus the technique of data collection used is primary data that is the Bantul Religious Court decision. To solve this problem, the Plaintiff and Defendant bring the case to the Religious Court. Religious court has the authorities to solve the marital problems, inheritance. Religious courts are one of the judicial body exercises for the justice seekers under Islamic perspective. Religious Courts are in charge to uphold the Compilation of Islamic law as a material law that applies to Muslims in Indonesia regarding certain civil cases regulated in the law The result of this study shows that the judge establishes the joint property of the Plaintiff and Defendant, and both have the right to receive a half of joint property has been appropriate with the rules already established by the Law Number 1 of 1974 and the Compilation of Islamic Law. This decision has been appropriate and not contradicting with the Islamic Law.

Keywords: *Joint Property, Religious Court, Dispute Settlement*

1. INTRODUCTION

As a legal state, Indonesia is regulating every single aspect under law and regulations. Originated from the general one up to the detail and private ones, such as our marriage, divorce, and its consequences. Discussing marriage, Indonesia also provides the regulation which concerns it, namely Law No 1 of 1974 about Marriage. According to the law, Marriage is an inner bond between a man and a woman as a husband and a wife in order to form a happy and eternal family (*household*) based on the One Godhead.¹ Nevertheless, there will be some issue might appear in a marriage even ended up to the divorce.

Divorce can occur due to various factors, such as economic, biological, psychological aspect and different views of life and so on that comes into the marriage to conflicts. Actually, in Islam, divorce is strongly not recommended but is legalized. It means, divorce should be as much as possible to be avoided.

To avoid the conflict on the property during the marriage or after divorce, prescribing the status of joint property during marriage is important to determine on how the status of a property if there is a death of one between husband and wife, to determine which property that will be inherited by the heirs. Likewise, if a divorce happens there must be a clarity of which property is the right of the wife and which belong to the husband. Joint property is a property earned by husband and wife together during a marriage.

The marriage property is also regulated under Islamic law, which gives the husband and wife the right to own a property on their own, and cannot be disturbed by others. A husband who receives gifts or inheritance without the wife contribution is allowed to fully control the inheritance by him shelves and vice versa. The property they had owned before the marriage also became their own respective rights.²

The property acquired during the marriage becomes a joint property. The property of each husband and wife as a gift or inheritance is under their respective control. Marital property in marriage law is a separate property.

¹ Article 1, Law No 1 of 1974 on Marriage

² Ahmad Azhar Basyir, 2014, *Hukum Perkawinan Islam*, Yogyakarta, UII press Yogyakarta, p.65

Meaning, all of the property that been brought into the marriage, remain controlled and owned by each party before married.³

As stated under Marriage law, Moslem can tackle their marriage's issue, including the divorce to the Religious courts, which is one of the judicial authorities to seek justice in certain civil cases that have been regulated in law. The duties and authorities of religious courts are to accept, examine, hear, settle cases, provides legal services and justice of family law and marital property for those who are Muslim, based on the Islamic law.⁴

The authority of religious courts is expanded into some matters, including the field of Islamic economics with the affirmation of the authority of religious courts in solving sharia economic case. Shariah economics is deeds or business activities conducted according to sharia principles, including Shariah bank, sharia insurance, sharia reassertion, Shariah bonds, and so on.⁵

In marriage cases, the examination of a case in a religious court is done generally as the civil law does except for examining marital disputes it is specifically regulated. Specific procedural laws include arrangements on case forms and proceedings, relative authority of religious courts, summoning parties, examination, verification, peace efforts, court fees, judges' verdicts, and issuance of divorce certificates.⁶

2. RESEARCH METHOD

2.1. Type of Research

The research was normative and empirical legal research which used the result of interview to respondent, related data from the agencies, and statute approach. In the research, the author was elaborated the concept and principles of library based on normative and empirical method. The Research was supported by the data that taken from the field research by means of interview and data retrieval with the knowledgeable informant.

³ Simanjuntak, 2016, *Hukum Perdata Indonesia*, Jakarta, Prenada Media Group, p.60

⁴ Mukti Arto, 2017, *Praktek Perkara Perdata pada Pengadilan Agama*, Yogyakarta, Pustaka Pelajar. p.1

⁵ Abdul Ghofur Anshori and Yulkarnaian Harahab, 2008, *Hukum Islam Dinamika dan Perkembangannya di Indonesia*, Yogyakarta, Kreasi Total Media. p.67

⁶ Mukti Arto, *Op. Cit*, p.206

2.2. Type of Data

The type of data of this research was secondary data. The researcher conducted a literature study by reviewing legal material to obtain the material for this research. The type of legal material used was primary legal material, secondary legal material, and tertiary legal material.

1. Primary legal data covering
 - a. Legislation
 - b. Jurisprudence
 - c. etc.
2. Secondary legal data including
 - a. Books
 - b. Journal
 - c. Scientific article
 - d. Trusted sited internet
3. Tertiary data

Tertiary data which consists of legal or non-legal materials related to the research to support and easier the understanding of the primary and secondary legal data.

2.3. Method of Collecting Data

- a. Library Research

The research is through the library research by literature learning. In this method, the data was collect by selected legal materials relevant to the topic of the role of local government in combating illegal mining in the Special Region of Yogyakarta.

- b. Interview

Interview is conversation with a specific purpose, then the conversation was done by both parties. It means that the interviewer who asks the questions and the respondent who provides answers to the question.

2.4. Data Analysis

The data were analyzed systematically through descriptive qualitative. Descriptive qualitative means that the data were analyzed based on related regulation, especially relating to the issue of marital property. In addition,

the method of analyzing data is primary collecting from the library and analyze the data by comparing it with other data like the law.

3. DISCUSSION

3.1. Joint Property According to Islamic Law and Indonesian Law

A. Joint Property According to Islamic Law

In general, Islamic law does not regulate any joint property. Islamic law is more concerned with the separation between husband and wife property. What the husband produces is the husband's property and what the wife produces, is the wife property. Islamic law is more familiar with the separation between husband and wife property. In the books of fiqh, joint property is defined as the wealth generated by husband and wife during marriage, so there is a mixing of the property from both parties and cannot be differentiated again. Islamic law also assumes that the property the husband acquires during marriage becomes the husband's right, while the wife is only eligible for the maintenance provided by her husband. Then, the wife is directly having the right to the property.⁷

Islam does not specifically regulate the distribution of joint property. Islam only provides general guidance in solving the problem of joint property. The distribution of joint property depends on the husband and wife agreement. The concept of joint property is not regulated in detail in Islamic law. The problem of joint property is an untouched or unthinkable legal matter (*ghoir al-mufakkar*) by the earlier fiqh scholars since the problem of a joint property has just emerged in this modern period.⁸ In Islam, issues that are often expressed are the issue of livelihood and

⁷ Abdul Manan, Harta Bersama (Gono-Gini) Hukum Perdata, <http://alfarabi1706.blogspot.com/2013/01/harta-bersama-gono-gini-hukum-perdata.html>. Accessed on Wednesday, 22th, march at 09:05 p.m.

⁸ Evi Djurniati "Hukum Harta Bersama Ditinjau dari Prespektif Undang-Undang Perkawinan dan KUH Perdata", *Jurnal Penelitian Hukum*, Vol.17, No.4 (Desember 2017) p.448

inheritance law. These two things are a lot of attention in highlighting the issue of property in marriage.⁹

Basically in Islam mixing property between husband and wife by marriage is not known, the property of the wife remains the property of the wife and is fully controlled by the wife and the wealth of the husband remains the property of the husband and fully controlled by the husband. Therefore, a woman married is still capable of acting without the help of her husband, including in the take care of the property, so that he can perform legal acts in society.¹⁰

The thing must be understood, that the husband's property is not as a whole, but reduced with some obligations as a husband. Like giving his wife's dowry, fulfilling the livelihood of his wife and child, and others. While the wife's estate remains intact because the wife has no obligation to providing her husband and children livelihood except for certain condition. In general, the husband is responsible for the livelihood and the family economy.¹¹

The joint property of husband and wife who work together in earning a living means that there is no *Syarikah* between husband and wife. SayutiThalib said there are several kinds of husband and wife property that are:

- a. Viewed from the point of the origin of husband and wife property it can be classified as below:
 - 1) The property of each husband and wife had before both derived from inheritance. Grants or their own businesses or can be cited as joint property.
 - 2) The property of each married couple after they have been in a marriage relationship, but acquired not from their

⁹ Besse Sugawati "Konsep Harta Bersama dari Prespektif Hukum Islam, Kitab Undang-Undang Hukum Perdata dan Hukum Adat", *Prespektif*, Volume XIX, No.3 (September 2014) p. 203

¹⁰ Etty Rochaeti, "Analisi Yuridis Tentang Harta Bersama dalam Perkawinan Menurut Pandangan Hukum Islam dan Hukum Positif" *Wawasan Hukum*, Vol.28 No.1 (Februari 2013) P.655

¹¹ Ahmad Sabiq, Harta Gono-Gini Dalam Islam, <https://konsultasisyariah.com/14448-teka-teki-harta-gono-gini.html> Accessed on March, 2018 at 5:30 p.m.

efforts either individually or jointly, but is a grant, a will, or an inheritance respectively.

- 3) The property gained after they are in a marriage for their business or the business from one of them is classified as a livelihood.
- b. Viewed from the point of use, then the property is used to:
 - 1) For the financing of households, families, children's education.
 - 2) Other assets.
 - c. Viewed from the point of the relationship between the property with individuals in society:
 - 1) Husband and wife property.
 - 2) One's possessions but bound to the family.
 - 3) One's possessions are expressly stated by the person concerned. The joint property is the property that a husband and wife acquire during a marriage, not regulated in the Qur'an, as it is entirely regulated to those concerned.

The study of scholars about joint property had risen the opinion that the joint property can be included in *syirkah*. *Syirkah* itself can be defined as mixing, while, according to *syara'* is the existence of the rights between two or more people about something. Joint property can be *qiyaskan* as *syirkah* because it can be understood that the wife also considered as people who work, although not kind of work at the company or institution. The work of the wife is such as taking care of household, cooking, washing, parenting and other domestic purposes.

While husband and wife have no joint property, there is *syirkah* or mixing of husband and wife property. The property that can be in *syirkah* is owned by husband and wife, property acquired during the marriage on the basis of inheritance, testament, or grant. *Syirkah* is a commitment which is born of the agreement.¹² The

¹² Amelia Rahmaniah "Harta Bersama dalam Perkawinan di Indonesia", *Jurnal Ilmu Hukum*, Vol.15 No.1 (Juni 2015) p.77

mixing (*Syarikah*) of husband and wife wealth can be implemented in the following:

1. *Syirkah* may be made with a written agreement, be said before or after the marriage agreement, whether the property is obtained before or after the marriage but not for the property that been obtain as individuals as from the livelihood property.
2. *Syirkah* can be established by law or legislation, that the property obtained during a marriage from the livelihood work is a joint property or *syirkah* property.
3. *Syirkah* property could be created silently during a marriage if, in reality, a couple works together to earn the property to maintain the family.

According to Syafi'iyah scholars, *Syirkah* divided into 4 namely:

1. *Syirkah inan* is if two people who work together to earn something and divide the profit equally.
2. *Syirkah abdan*, is two people work together when they do something and divide the profit based on the argument they have made.
3. *Syirkah muwafadhah* is when people do the work and divide the profit based on the capital and effort they have spent even though it is unknown to others.¹³
4. *Syirkah wujuh* is *syirkah* without work or property with the basis of trust between others.

According to Shafi'i scholars, only *syirkah 'inan* is allowed to be implemented while the truth from the rest of the *Syirkah* is still questionable. Since Islam is only discussed in broad outline, it raises a different interpretation of joint property. Meanwhile, according to hanafiah scholars *syirkah* divided into two namely:

¹³ Liky Faizal "Hrta Bersama dalam Perkawinan", *Jurnal Ilmu Hukum*, Vol.15, No.1 (Juni 2015) p.87

1. *Syirkah milk* (share ownership of property)

This *syirkah* can be interpreted as a form of an intention between two or more people to something in the absence of contract or agreement. *Syirkah* is divided into two kinds, namely *syirkah* with enforcement and *syirkah* with a choice.

2. *Syirkah 'uqud* (cooperation with contract)

Syirkah 'uqud is a partnership that occurs because through a contract. *Syirkah* is divided into three kinds, namely *Syirkah bil 'Amwal* (with capital), *Syirkah bil Abdan* (with power), and *Syirkah bil Wujud* (with trust).

Based on this division, *syirkah 'uqud* can be grouped in several kinds as follows:

1. *Syirkah mufawadhah bil 'amwal*, is a cooperation between two or more persons with conditions, that (1) the existence of equality between them in terms of capital, authority, and religion, (2) each person is responsible to his other comrades.
2. *Syirkah 'inan bil 'amwal*, is an engagement between two persons or more in a commercial form but it is not mentioned who take the responsibility.
3. *Syirkah abdan mufawadhah* is a form of cooperation that uses effort as the capital.

According to prof dr Ismail Muhammad Syah joint property is classified into two namely *syirkah abdan* and *muafadhah*. He said that in general, Indonesian people work together to earn property for daily living or just saving for the future. Based on the explanation of *syirkah*, it can be concluded that the joint property with husband and wife can be grouped into the concept of *syirkah abdan* or *syirkah mufawadhah*.

According to M. Yahya Harahap, the Islamic law's perspective on a joint property is in line with what Muhammad Shah said that the livelihood of husband and wife should be included in *rubu' mu'amalah*, but it was not specifically discussed. This may be due to the fact that the authors of the fiqh books are

Arabs who generally do not know the how husband and wife togetherness to earn the property known as *syirkah*.

Islamic law is more familiar with the property separation between husband and wife except for the existence of the agreement before marriage; joint property is not explained clearly and firmly in Islamic law. The joint property problem is the results of scholars' *ijtihad* which essentially includes all the treasures that been obtained in a marriage to the category of joint property.

Joint property between husband and wife can be divided if the marriage has been breaking up. The marriage bond is cut off due to death, divorce and court decisions. Basically, the marriage property in Islamic law is separated between the property of the wife and the husband, derived from the inheritance, the grant, or from the husband and wife business both before and after marriage.¹⁴

Every property brought into marriage does not automatically become unified with the property acquired during the marriage, but each of the property is separated and becomes each husband and wife's rights to be controlled.¹⁵ Based on the explanation, it can be concluded that the joint property is a form of *syirkah* because of the meaning itself is a form of cooperation or partnership between husband and wife, it's just not *syirkah* in general, that regulated in business activities, *syirkah* in joint property is a form of cooperation between husband and wife to build a family that is *sakinah, mawaddah, and rahmah*.

There is no specific rule about the distribution of joint property in Islam. Islam only provides general guidance in solving the problem of joint property. The division of joint property is based on the agreement of the husband and wife, which in the Qur'an is called by the term "*ash Shulhu*" which is a covenant to

¹⁴ Elfina Tanjung "Dampak Perceraian Terhadap Harta Bersama Menurut Hukum Islam dan Undang-Undang Nomor 1 Tahun 1974 Tentang Perkawinan", *Jurnal Hukum*, Vol.10, No.1 (Januari-Juni 2015) p.52

¹⁵ Muhammad Nur "Kedudukan Harta Bersama dalam Perkawinan menurut Prespektif Hukum Islam", *Jurnal Hukum*, Vol.10, No.1 (Januari-Juni 2015) p.177

make peace between the two sides (husband and wife) after the dispute.¹⁶

B. The status of joint property according to Indonesian Law

Joint property is regulated in both Law Number 1 of 1974 and The Compilation of Islamic Law. Thus, all matters regarding joint property are constituted by both sources. Concerning the joint property on the law No. 1 of 1974 in Chapter VII entitled "joint property in marriage" consist of several articles namely articles 35, 36 and 37.

a. Law Number 1 of 1974 on Marriage

- 1) Article 35 of Law no. 1 the Year 1974 about Marriage
 - a) Property acquired during the marriage.
 - b) The property of each husband and wife and property acquired respectively as a gift or inheritance, shall be under their respective control as long as the parties do not specify otherwise.
- 2) Article 36 of Law no. 1 the Year 1974 about Marriage
 - a) Regarding joint property, husband or wife can act upon agreement of both parties.
 - b) Regarding their respective possessions, husbands and wives shall have the full right to do legal acts concerning their property.
- 3) Article 37 of Law no. 1 the Year 1974 about Marriage
 - a) When a marriage breaks up due to a divorce, joint property is regulated according to their respective laws.

In the provisions of Article 35 on Law No. 1 of 1974, it is clear that the property in marriage consists of joint property and innate property. Joint property is the property acquired during the marriage become the right of each party. Therefore, if

¹⁶ Arifah Maspake "Kedudukan Harta Bersama dalam Perkawinan Menurut Fiqh dan Hukum Positif Indonesia Serta Praktek Putusan Pengadilan Agama", *Jurnal Hukum*, Vol.10, No.1 (Januari-Juni 2015) p.68

the couple wants to do something to the joint property it needs mutual consent from one another. While the innate property is the property earned by each husband or wife as a gift or inheritance during the marriage bond and fully controlled by each party.¹⁷

According to Wahyono Darmabrata and Surini Ahlan Sjarif marriage property according to the law no 1 the year 1974 is divided into:

1. Joint property is a property earned during marriage until the marriage ends or break-up due to divorce, death and court decision. Joint property includes:
 - a. The property gained during the marriage
 - b. Property gained as gifts or inheritance
 - c. Debts incurred during marriage except for each personal property.
2. Personal property is the inherent property of a husband and wife which is a permanent property under the control of a husband and wife as long as not specifically determined in the marriage agreement. In other words, personal property is a property owned by a husband and wife before they marry. Personal property includes:
 - a. The property that each of the couples brings to a marriage includes unpaid debts before the marriage takes place.
 - b. Property acquired as a gift or gift from another party
 - c. Property earned by husband and wife because of inheritance unless
 - d. The proceeds of the husband and wife's private property throughout the marriage take place including the debt arising from the management of the personal property.

¹⁷ Slamet Abidin dan Aminudin, *fiqh munakahat I*, 2009 Bandung Pustaka Setia, p. 182

Marriage Law No. 1 of 1974, the matter of joint property is only briefly and generally set out in Chapter VII comprising Articles 35 to 37. It is then clarified by the Compilation of Islamic Laws in Chapter XIII from Articles 85 to 97.¹⁸

Joint property is generally divided equally between husband and wife. This is based on the provision of Article 128 of the Civil Code of Law which states that "after the dissolution of the unity, the property of unity is divided between husband and wife, or between their heirs respectively, regardless of which side of the goods they get". Meanwhile, the possessions and the acquisition property automatically remain the rights of each person without being shared.

The joint property can be shared if the marriage is broken, it may be broken by death, divorce and court decision. The broken marriage due to death has a certain legal standing since the death of one party. In the formal law the property is allowed to be shared after the death, but in reality, the property only is shared after the funeral. In this case, if the judge's verdict does not have a certain legal decision then the property is not allowed to be shared yet.¹⁹

3.2. The Procedures of Settlement of Joint Property in Bantul Religious Court

A. The Procedures of Settlement of Joint Property

The marital property disputes after a divorce would generally make the joint property divided into two equally.²⁰ Based on the interviews with the judges of Bantul religious court Yuniati Faizah, she said in Bantul Religious Court the lawsuit of joint property is applied in a separated file. Although there is a lawsuit about the joint property and a divorce that applied at the same time the judge would

¹⁸ M. Yahya Harahap, 2005, *Kedudukan Kewenangan dan Acara Peradilan Agama*, Jakarta: Rineka Cipta, p 272.

¹⁹ M Idris Ramulyo, 2006, "*Hukum Perkawinan, Kewarisan, Acara Pegadilan Agama dan Zakat Menurut Hukum Islam*" Sinar Grafika, Tebing Tinggi. P 85

²⁰ Felicitas Marcelina Waha, "Penyelesaian Sengketa Atas Harta Perkawinan Setelah Bercerai", *Lex et Societatis*, Vol.1, No.1 (Januari-Maret 2013) p.59

give advise to separate the file. The step of dispute settlement of joint property in the Bantul religious court is as follows:

- a. Mediation
- b. The reading of the lawsuit
- c. Defendant's response
- d. Counter-response (*Replik*)
- e. Rebuttal (*Duplik*)
- f. Evidence
- g. Conclusions
- h. Deliberation of the panel judges
- i. Decision reading

As for the execution, it has been written that both parties would divide the property as equal directly or by auction. The auction will occur if one of the parties submits the execution of the joint property.²¹

- a. Mediation

Based on Supreme Court Regulations No 1 of 2016, mediation is a way of dispute resolution through negotiation process to get an agreement of the parties assisted by a mediator.²² The mediator is a neutral party who helps the parties in the negotiation process to seek possible dispute resolution without forcing the settlement.

According to Priatna Abdurrasyid, mediation is a peace process in which the disputing parties hand over the settlement to a mediator to achieve a fair outcome, effective and fully accepted by both parties. The third party (mediator) acts as a companion and advisor. Mediation is used in many societies to solve conflict cases.

²¹ Interview with Yuniati Faizah on 6 July 2018 in Bantul Religious Court.

²² Article 1, Supreme Court Regulations No 1 of 2016

In the mediation process, the presence and participation of the parties play an important role and determines whether or not the mediation process proceeds. Before the first trial starts, the judge needs to persuade the parties so they are willing to make peace reconciliation. It is not only in divorce and joint property cases, but mediation must be done in every case that been applied to the court. After the mediation effort is done the result is given to the panel judges. This peace effort was made in the first trial before entering the main examination stage of the case, this peace effort must also be done and attempted in every session before the decision readings.

In this meditation session both parties must attend and the judges will provide the parties with a chance to deliberate the decision. However, if there is no result from the mediation then it would proceed to the next process that is the reading of the lawsuit.

b. The reading of the lawsuit

In this process, mostly focusing on how the movable and immovable property should become the joint property and discussing that the plaintiff feels severely disadvantaged by the Defendant's attitude, therefore, the Plaintiff would ask the joint property to be divided equally.

c. Defendant's response

At this stage, the defendant is given the opportunity to defend himself and submit all his interests to the plaintiff.

d. Counter-Response and Rebuttal

The next agenda after the Defendant's answer is counter-response. Plaintiffs are given a first chance to respond to the Defendant's exception by filing a counter-response. Counter-response can be interpreted to give a response from the Defendant. In this case, the Plaintiff filed a counter-response which essentially stated that the Plaintiff remained to the original claim.

After the Plaintiff filed a counter-response, the Defendant also had the opportunity to respond by filing a rebuttal to the Plaintiff. The rebuttal is the Defendant's reply to the counter-response.

The rebuttal is the response from the defendant on the counter-response that has given to the plaintiff. In this case, the defendant filed a rebuttal which is essentially fixed on the original answer. After the process of counter-response and rebuttal completed, then the trial continued with the process of evidentiary.

e. Evidentiary

The next agenda is evidentiary the purpose of evidentiary is to provide certainty to the judge about the truth of the disputed.²³ In this process, each party has to know the evidence that must be submitted to strengthen their arguments. The evidence can be in a written form such as letters or notarial deeds or it may present the witnesses. Where there is no written evidence, the party required to prove something by seeking the persons who have seen, hearing and experiencing the events that must be proven. Such persons have the capacity before the judge as a witness.

f. Conclusion

After the evidentiary process has completed, the next agenda is the conclusion The parties are given an opportunity to give a conclusion from all the previous process. The best conclusion is would give benefit to themselves. The conclusions must be systematic, and clear. Making conclusions is not necessary but it is useful for judges in making a decision.

g. Discussion of the panel of judges

The judge's discussion is where the judges negotiate or to exchange opinions, in seeking a decision on a case. They will unify their perceptions and understanding of the cases and the

²³ Elisabeth Nurhaini Butarbutar, "Arti Pentingnya Pembuktian dalam Proses Penemuan HUKUM di Peradilan Perdata", *Mimbar Hukum*. Volume 22 (juni,2010), p 351

solutions. The process would be led by the Chairman of the Panel of Judges. The first opportunity to express an opinion was given to Judge II, next is the Judge I, and lastly the Chairman. If there is a disagreement between the panels, the differences are resolved by voting.

h. Decision reading

According to Sudikno Mertokusumo, the judge's decision is a statement by the judge, as a state official authorized to do so, read out at the hearing to end the case or dispute between the parties. Furthermore, it is said, that a judge's decision consists of 4 parts, namely:

- 1) the head of the verdict
- 2) the identity of the parties
- 3) considerations
- 4) *amar* decision

Meanwhile, according to Mukti Arto, the decision is the statement of the judge which is expressed in written form and pronounced by the judge in a court session open to the public, as a result of the examination of a lawsuit.

B. The Procedure of Settlement of Joint Property Case No 0176//Pdt.G/2015/PA.Btl.

Based on the Law no 1 of 1974 Joint property is property obtained during a marriage. Whereas, based on the compilation of Islamic law, widows or widowers each of them entitled to one-half of the joint property as long as they did not determine otherwise in the marriage agreement. The plaintiff in decision No. 0176/Pdt.G/PA.Btl did not get his right to joint property.

The Bantul Religious Court on 5 February 2015 received a Joint Property claim from the plaintiff named Ngatiyem. Ngatiyem, 40 years, Islam, an entrepreneur, residing in Cempluk, Mangunan, Dlingo, was the plaintiff. The Plaintiff claimed that the joint property until now has not been distributed to the plaintiff and the property

now is controlled by the Defendant. In this case, Sugiman, 42 years, a civil servant, residing in Cempluk, Mangunan, Dlingo, was a defendant.

The Compilation of Islamic Law has explained that the wife has the right to half of the joint property. The Plaintiff has attempted to settle the joint property with the Defendant in a family manner, assisted by local residents but not succeeded. The plaintiff also said that she has not gets given a living during the marriage, the plaintiff feels very disadvantaged about this. Therefore, the plaintiff filed this case to the religious court. Based on the data obtained by the researcher from the results of an interview with one of the religious court judges in Bantul, there were steps that had to be passed during the proceedings:

a. Mediation

In this case, the panel of judges tried to reconcile the plaintiff and the defendant to deliberate on the property and share it in a family manner, and give both parties the opportunity to make peace through mediation but not successful.

b. Reading of a lawsuit

After the peaceful effort carried out by the panel of judges was unsuccessful then the plaintiff's claim was read out. In this lawsuit, the plaintiff requested to state legally that movable or immovable property was a joint asset, and he requested this joint property to be divided into 2 between the Plaintiff and the Defendant.

c. Defendant's response

After reading the plaintiff's lawsuit, the defendant has submitted an answer, then accompanied by an estimated price on the hearing on May 21, 2015. As stated in decision No. 0176/Pdt.G/PA.Btl

d. Counter-response (*Replik*)

The Plaintiff filed a counter-response which basically the plaintiff remained in the original lawsuit. The complete counter-response is contained in the minutes on March 26, 2015

e. Rebuttal (*Duplik*)

The Defendant filed a rebuttal which essentially remained the original answer. The complete rebuttal is noted in the court's minutes' data on 9 April 2015

f. Evidence

The Plaintiff has submitted written evidence and brought witnesses, and the Defendant confirmed all written evidence and statements of witnesses submitted by the Plaintiff. The Defendant stated that he did not submit written evidence or submit witnesses.

g. Conclusion

In this case, the Plaintiff submitted a conclusion in writing requesting that the Plaintiff and the Defendant's property of a female cow and its baby are set as joint property and divided into two for the Plaintiff and Defendant. Meanwhile, the Defendant verbally concludes that the joint property between plaintiff and Defendant are requested to be divided as fairly as possible.

h. Discussion of the panel of judges

In deciding this case the judges have several considerations, that Plaintiff and Defendant have been proven during the marriage period they have joint property. The Plaintiff and the Defendant each is entitled to receive a half of the joint property. Joint property is under the control of the Defendant, then he gets the punishment to give of twenty million rupiahs plus two motorbikes to the Plaintiff. Based on article 35 paragraph (1) of the Law No 1 of 1974 and article 97 of the Compilation of Islamic Law, the Assembly shall determine joint property with the Plaintiff and each of them has the right to get one-half of the joint property.

i. Decision reading

In this decision, the panel of judges was determined that the plaintiff's claim was partially granted and stipulates that both parties get half of the joint property.

Based on the case no: 0176/Pdt.G/2015/PA.Btl, it can be concluded that for resolving this case is in accordance with the dispute settlement procedure in the Bantul Religious Court. The settlement

of this joint property dispute can be used to resolve other cases of joint property.

4. CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTION

4.1. Conclusion

Based on the description in the analysis of the results of the research, then the author can infer some things, i.e.:

First, the status of joint property in Islamic law and Indonesian law. In Islamic law the joint property in marriage is only the property of the husband. However, some scholars argue about the position of joint property in marriage. The scholars and Islamic jurists consider the absence of joint property in Islamic institutions except with the concept of *syirkah*. Joint property in Islam is a form of *syirkah* because *syirkah* is a form of cooperation or partnership between husband and wife, *Syirkah* is an engagement that is emerged from the existence of an agreement. Mainwhile in Indonesian law, in the provisions of the legislation, it is stated that joint property is the property acquired during the marriage and so it belongs to the husband and wife. This is in accordance with the provisions of the Law No. 1 of 1974 in Chapter VII Articles 35, 36 and 37 and the Compilation of Islamic Law Article 85 to Article 97. Based on the provisions of the law, the distribution of the joint property is done fairly, so would not cause any injustice between husband and wife.

Second, the procedures of the settlement of joint property disputes in the Bantul Religious Court is started with mediation. If the mediation is successful, then the case is completed but if it fails then it will proceed to the lawsuit reading. Next is the lawsuit answer or response. The lawsuit response is followed by counter-response and rebuttal. Submission of evidence is coming after rebuttal. After the evidentiary process is completed, the plaintiff and defendant will submit the conclusion. After a conclusion is completed, the panel judges' will conduct the judges' deliberation. The last stages of court hearing will be the court's judgment deliberation. Those are the stages of hearing in the religious court of the settlement of joint property disputes.

4.2. Recommendation

Based on the problem that has been discussed, it can be proposed with two recommendations. *First*, the sharing of joint property should be done through deliberation by considering the principle of justice between husband and wife. Fair distribution will avoid disputes. *Second*, the religious court must be careful in deciding a case of dispute settlement of the joint property to give a fair decision so that no parties would feel aggrieved over the decision, and the decision must also be in accordance with the law.

REFERENCES

Books and Journals:

- Ahmad Azhar Basyir, 2014, *Hukum Perkawinan Islam*, Yogyakarta, UII press Yogyakarta.
- Arifah Maspake “Kedudukan Harta Bersama dalam Perkawinan Menurut Fiqh dan Hukum Positif di Indonesia Serta Praktek Putusan Pengadilan Agama”, *Jurnal Hukum Khaira Ummah*, Vol. 12 No 2 (Juni 2017)
- Besse Sugiswati “Konsepsi Harta Bersama dari Perspektif Hukum Islam, Kitab Undan-gundang Hukum Perdata dan Hukum Adat”, *Prespektif*, Volume XIX No 3 (September 2014)
- Elisabeth Nurhaini Butarbutar, “Arti Pentingnya Pembuktian dalam Proses Penemuan HUKUM di Peradilan Perdata”, *Mimbar Hukum*. Volume 22 (Juni, 2010)
- Elfina Tanjung “Dampak Perceraian Terhadap Harta Bersama Menurut Hukum Islam dan Undang-Undang Nomor 1 Tahun 1974 Tentang Perkawinan”, *Jurnal Hukum*, Vol 10, No 1 (Januari-Juni 2015)
- Ety Rochaeti, “Analisi Yuridis Tentang Harta Bersama dalam Perkawinan Menurut Pandangan Hukum Islam dan Hukum Positif” *Wawasan Hukum*, Vol.28 No.1 (Februari 2013)
- Evi Djurniati “Hukum Harta Bersama Ditinjau dari Prespektif Undang-Undang Perkawinan dan Kitab Undang-Undang Hukum Perdata”, *Jurnal Penelitian Hukum*, Vol 17, No 4 (Desember 2017)
- Felicitas Marcelina Waha “Penyelesaian Sengketa Atas Harta Perkawinan Setelah Bercerai”, *Lex et Societatis*, Vol 1, No 1 (Januari-Maret 2013)
- Liky Faizal “Hrta Bersama dalam Perkawinan”, *Jurnal Ilmu Hukum*, Vol.15, No.1 (Juni 2015)
- M Idris Ramulyo, 2006, *Hukum Perkawinan, Hukum Kewarisan, Hukum Peradilan Agama dan Zakat Menurut Hukum Islam*, Jakarta, Sinar Grafika.
- Muhammad Nur “Kedudukan Harta Bersama dalam Perkawinan Menurut Prespektif Hukum Islam”, *Lex Privatum*, Vol 1, No 1 (Juli 2013)
- Mukti Arto, 2017, *Praktek Perkara Perdata pada Pengadilan Agama*, Yogyakarta, Pustaka Pelajar.
- M Yahya Harahap, 2005, *Kumpulan Makalah Hukum Acara Perdata, Pendidikan Hakim Senior*, Jakarta, Rineka Cipta.
- Simanjuntak, 2016, *Hukum Perdata Indonesia*, Jakarta, Prenada Media Group.
- Slamet Abidin dan Aminudin, 2009, *Fiqh Munakahat I*, Bandung, Pustaka Setia.

Legal Instruments:

Compilation of Islamic Law

Law No 1 of 1974 on Marriage

Law no. 50 of 2009 about Second Amendment to Law of Number 7 the Year 1989 on Religious Judiciary.

Supreme Court Regulation No 1 of 2016

Internets:

Abdul Manan “Harta Bersama (Gono-Gini) Hukum Perdata”
<http://alfarabi1706.blogspot.com/2013/01/harta-Bersama-gono-Gini-hukum-perdata.html> Accessed on Wednesday, March 22th, 2018, at 09:05 .pm

Ahmad Sabiq, Harta Gono-Gini Dalam Islam,
<https://konsultasisyariah.com/14448-teka-teki-harta-gono-gini.html>
Accessed on March, 2018 at 5:30 p.m.