CHAPTER III

ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS

In this chapter, in implementing the program there are factors influencing the success of Baubau city management and utilization policy, according to William N. Dunn's evaluation criteria of effectiveness, efficiency, adequacy, equity, responsiveness, and accuracy.

In Baubau city spatial plans implementation, it must refer to the spatial product in the city namely Local Government Regulation number 4 of 2014 on Baubau City Spatial Plans from September 30, 2014 to 2034 or for 20 years term of implementation. *RTRW* itself becomes a guideline in Baubau city as the level below province which then illustrated to the hierarchy below is the Spatial Detail Plan (RDTR) (see Chart 4.1) which speaks within the context of operational permits.



Chart 4.1. Baubau City Spatial Plans Hierarchy

Source: Secondary Data Analysis, 2018

When an institution or individual have purpose to build a construction, it must refer to RDTR which in RDTR there are 3 points to be considered:

- 1. Allowed but limited
- 2. Conditionally Allowed
- 3. Not allowed

After RDTR, there are RTBL (Building and Environment Plan) which already covers the area for example in Wolio sub district there is Kotamara area as the reclamation zone. Based on Baubau City Regulation No. 4 of 2014 on spatial planning, Baubau city spatial management is the responsibility of Public Works and Spatial Planning, Environment Agency, Housing and Settlement Service Office and related institutions. These agencies also play a role in planning and implementing effective and efficient spatial planning, utilization and maintenance of Baubau city spaces.

Baubau city government through the spatial planning agency to implement the program management and utilization of urban space where space management has 4 aspects consisting of:

- Delegation shall be the management of the land acquisition of the land to the Kecamatan, while the management of the land conversion will be fully managed by the Department of Public Works and Spatial Planning of Baubau City.
- 2. Utilization is in the utilization of urban spaces shall consider the viability and full function of existing facilities in it.

- 3. Maintenance is the maintenance of Baubau city space that is the responsibility of all elements of society that is by observing the rules that apply in the arrangement of Baubau city space.
- Control is the utilization of Baubau city space done by Public Works and Spatial Planning, Environment Agency, Office of Housing and Settlement Area and related institutions.

3.1. Effectiveness

3.1.1. Urban spatial plan implementation in Baubau city in achieving the whole objectives as center of trading and services regarding the vision of Baubau city.

The Baubau City Spatial Plan has been declared by the issuance of Local Regulation No. 4 of 2014 for the planning year 2014 to 2034. The Baubau City Spatial Plan in the document planning of Baubau city as can be seen in Table 3.1. Based on Table 3.1. Land use in Baubau City can be explained as follows.

- Protected areas, constituting designated areas with the primary function of protecting the environment which includes natural resources and artificial resources. The protected areas in Baubau City include: protected forest with an area of 15.2%, highways (0.6%), urban forest (1.4%) Keraton Buton Heritage Reserve (0.3%) and conservation beach (0.2%)
- 2. Area of Cultivation, is an area that is established with the main function to be cultivated on the basis of conditions and potential of natural

resources, human resources, and artificial resources. The cultivation areas in Baubau City include: production forests (3.8%), limited production forests (13.2%), rice fields (1.2%), dryland farming (20%), mining areas (16.3%), settlements (11.7%), parks (0.4%), public facilities (1.9%) and social facilities (11.8 ha). (11.7 ha), warehousing (1.2%), airport area (0.8%), port area (0.5% (0.2%), TPA (13.2 ha), Defense and Security (0.5%), and Coastal Tourism (0.5%).

N.	See a 4 al Da 44 anna Dhana	Width			
INO	Spatial Pattern Plan	Ha	%		
	Protected Fo	orest			
1	Protected forest	4.399,60	15,2		
2	Great Forest	177.07.00	0,6		
3	City Forest	391.07.00	1,3		
4	Cultural heritage	87.04.00	0,3		
5	Coastal Conservation	62.08.00	0,2		
	Area of Cultiv	vation			
1	Production forest	1,347.6	4,6		
2	Limited production forest	3,826.4	13,2		
3	Rice fields	353.05.00	1,2		
4	Dryland Farming	5,792.7	20		
5	Mining Area	4,718.0	16,3		
6	Settlement	3,412.0	11,8		
7	Garden	128.02.00	0,4		
8	Public facilities	557.03.00	1,9		
9	Social Facilities	11.08	0		
10	Offices	1,085.7	3,7		
11	Trade and Services	1,451.5	5		
12	Fishery Industry	11.02	0		
13	Warehousing	352.04.00	1,2		
14	Airport Area	217.09.00	0,8		
15	Port Area	140.09.00	0,5		
16	Pertamina Area	61.06.00	0,2		
17	PLTU	109.07.00	0,4		
18	ТРА	13.02	0		
19	Defense and Security Area	155.08.00	0,5		
20	Beaches Tourism	149.02.00	0,5		
	Total	29,016.0	100		

Tabel 3.1. Spatial Pattern Plan of Baubau City Year 2014-2034

Source: Dinas Tata Bangunan dan Kota (2014)

As already explained in the Law of the Republic of Indonesia No. 26 of 2007 on Spatial Planning that spatial planning activities are spatial planning process, space utilization, and control of space utilization. In the process of controlling the utilization of space, it is necessary to evaluate the extent of Spatial Plan Plan which has been prepared for subsequent prepared action plan / follow up. The evaluation is to provide an assessment of the consistency of Spatial Plan Plan, ie how far the consistency in Spatial Plan Development, and how much land use has been consistently following the Spatial Plan that has been made in this Baubau City RTRW.

According to Table 3.2., there is a difference in the number of columns between the spatial plan patterns of 2014-2034 and the 2015 land use. It is evident that for the planning year of Baubau City 2014-2034, the Regional Government plans to expand the area by reclaiming the coast, 2004-2010 has been done coastal reclamation area of 20.4 ha. Previously in 2004 the area of Baubau City was 28,933.4 ha and now the area of Baubau City is 28,980.4 and when looking at Table 3.2. then the Local Government will still re-increase the area of Baubau city area of 35.6 ha until the end of the planning period.

Tabel 3.2. Matrix of Land Conformity Year 2015 Against Spatial Plan of RTRW of Baubau City 2014-2034

		Wi	dth		Width						
No	Spatial Pattern Plan	На	%	Landuse	На	%					
			Protected	Area							
1	Protected forest	4.399,60	15,2	Protected forest	4,471.9	15.04					
2	Great Forest	177.07.00	0,6	HSAW Tirta Rimba	466.02.00	01.06					
3	City Forest	391.07.00	1,3	City Forest	339.09.00	01.02					
4	Cultural heritage	87.04.00	0,3	Great Forest	108.09.00	00.04					
				Mangrove area	70.09.00	00.02					
5	Coastal Conservation	62.08.00	0,2	Cultural Heritage Area	28.07.00	00.01					
				Coastal Conservation	36.03.00	00.01					
Cultivation Area											
1	Production forest	1,347.7	04.06	Production forest	1,275.8	04.04					
2	Limited production forest	3,826.4	13.02	Limited production forest	4,971.1	17.02					
			Set	tlement							
	Settlement	3,412.0	11.08	Settlement	3,338.1	11.05					
3	Garden	128.02.00	00.04	Garden	125.08.00	00.04					
	Social Facilities	11.08	00.00	Social Facilities	11.06	00.00					
	Public facilities	557.03.00	01.09	Public facilities	493.08.00	01.07					
4	Rice fields 353.05.00 01.02 Rice fields				1,274.9	04.04					
5	Dryland Farming	5,792.7	20.00	Dryland Farming	5,666.5	19.06					
			Min	ing Area							
6	Nickel Mining	1,795.7	06.02	Nickel Mining	569.08.00	02.00					
	Other Mining	2,922.3	10.01	Other Mining	2,922.3	10.01					
7	Fishery Industry	11.02	00.00	Fishery Industry	05.05	00.00					
8	Beach tourism	149.02.00	00.05	Beach tourism	108.00.00	00.04					
			Trans	sportation							
0	Airport Area	217.09.00	00.08	Airport Area	213.00.00	00.07					
,	Port Area	140.09.00	00.05	Port Area	90.00.00	00.03					
	r olt Alea	140.09.00	00.05	Terminal Area	10.08	00.00					
				Etc							
	Offices	1,085.7	03.07	Offices	1,007.1	03.05					
	Trade and Services	1,451.5	05.00	Trade and Services	976.09.00	03.04					
	Warehousing	352.04.00	01.02	Warehousing	16.06	00.01					
	Pertamina Special	(1.0(.00)	00.02	Denter a fine for a lat Territerre	50.02.00	00.02					
10	Territory	61.06.00	00.02	Pertamina Special Territory	59.08.00	00.02					
	Defense and Security	155.08.00	00.05	Defense and Security Area	155.08.00	00.05					
	Area	155.08.00	00.05	Detense and Security Area	155.08.00	00.05					
	TPA	13.02	00.00	TPA	13.02	00.00					
	PLTU	109.07.00	00.04	PLTU	109.07.00	00.04					
				Tambak	41.04.00	00.01					
	Total Initial State	29,	016	Land Area Changed	2,72	.7.8					
	Total Area	29	016	Land Area Un-changed	26,2	52.6					
	i Stai Ai Cu	<i>2</i> ,		Total Area	28,9	80.4					

Source: Dinas Pekerjaan Umum dan Penataan Ruang, 2018

Tabel 3.3.Landuse Change in 2015 Against Space Pattern of Baubau City 2014-2034

		Change of Landuse								
No	Spatial Pattern Plan	Increa	sement	Decrea	sement					
		Ha	%	Ha	%					
Protected Area										
1	Protected forest	72.03.00	02.07							
2	HSAW Tirta Rimba	466.02.00	17.01							
3	City Forest			51.08.00	01.09					
4	Great Forest			68.08.00	02.05					
	Mangrove area	71.00.00	02.06							
5	Cultural Heritage Area			58.08.00	02.01					
	Coastal Conservation			26.05.00	01.00					
	C	ultivation Are	a							
1	Production forest			71.08.00	02.06					
2	Limited production forest	1,144.7	42.00.00							
	Settlement									
	Settlement			73.09.00	02.07					
3	Garden			02.04	00.01					
	Social Facilities			00.02	00.00					
	Public facilities			63.05.00	02.03					
4	Rice fields	921.05.00	33.08.00							
5	Dryland Farming			126.02.00	04.06					
6	Mining									
	Nickel Mining			1,225.9	44.04.00					
7	Tambak	41.04.00	01.05							
8	Fishery Industry			05.07	00.02					
9	Coastal Tourist Area			41.02.00	01.05					
		Offic	e area							
	Regions Trade & Services			78.06.00	02.08					
10	Area Warehousing			474.06.00	17.02					
	Port Special Area			335.08.00	12.02					
	Pertamina			01.08	00.01					
		Transpo	ortation							
11	Seaports			04.08	00.02					
	Airport			51.00.00	01.08					
	Terminal	10.07	00.04							
	Total	2,7	27.8	2,763.4						

Source: Dinas Pekerjaan Umum dan Penataan Ruang, 2018

Table 3.3 shows that in the preparation of Spatial Plan Pattern RTRW Baubau City Year 2014-2034 inconsistency occurred. The inconsistency in the preparation of the Local Government Spatial Plan has violated the prevailing laws and regulations. The form of inconsistency is as follows:

- 1. Based on existing land cover / land area in Baubau area is 1,274,9 ha, but local government plans to allocate only 353,5 ha of paddy field, and the rest is planned for other designation. Thus, the City Government of Baubau has violated the mandate of the Law of the Republic of Indonesia Number 41 Year 2009 on the Protection of Sustainable Agriculture Food Land which aims among others; 1) To safeguard the sustainable agriculture and food lands, 2) To ensure the availability of sustainable food crops, 3) To realize food self-sufficiency, sustainability, and sovereignty, 4) To protect the ownership of agricultural land belonging to the farmers. Based on the results of research that land cover / use of rice fields in Baubau City has a trend to continue to grow, unlike the case of urban areas in Indonesia generally have a tendency of degradation of paddy fields.
- 2. Loss of existence of Nature Reserve Nature of Tirta Rimba from Spatial Plan RTRW Baubau City Year 2014-2034. Based on Government Regulation Number 26 of 2008 Nature Reserve Nature Reserve is one of the protected areas that should not be changed its designation. However, in the RTRW Spatial Plan Pattern of Baubau

City in 2011-2031, HSAW Tirta Rimba belonging to protected areas is not included in the Spatial Plan Plan, and instead the area is designated as Warehousing Area.

- 3. Mangrove area is one of the protected areas. Land Use Coverage of Baubau City Year 2010-2015 The city of Baubau has a mangrove area with an area of 227.7 ha. An area of 156.7 ha of its existence has been designated as an urban forest area and a coastal conservation area where both designations are part of a protected area in Baubau City. However, there is still a mangrove area of 71 ha which has the potential to switch function if it is not established into the existing protected area in Baubau City.
- 4. Based on Table 20, it is known that the 2015 land cover / land use on Spatial Plan Plan changes land use by 2,727.9 ha. Some land cover / land use changes as a result of deviations in the preparation of the Spatial Plan include HSAW Tirta Rimba (466.2 ha) land cover, rice field (921.5 ha), mangrove (71 ha), limited production forest 1,144,7 ha), protected forest (72,3 ha), and pond (41,4 ha).
- 5. Addition of the area of Production Forest due to the widespread reduction of the nickel mining area. Based on Spatial Plan, the area of nickel mining is 1,795.2 hectares determined based on permit to use forest area for exploration activities through letter of Minister of Forestry Decree No. S.186 / Menhut-VII / PW / 2008 which is then stipulated in Spatial Plan Plan as area exploitation of nickel, but the

permit to borrow forest area for exploitation activities given by the Ministry of Forestry is only 575,04 ha through Minister of Forestry Decree no. SK.456 / Menhut-II / 2012. Then the rest must be returned to its basic function as a limited production forest area. This is the polemic in society.

3.1.2. The function of each government units in implementing urban spatial plan to achieve the goals

Problems in spatial planning Baubau city is very diverse but with different cases, the point is that people can take advantage of the space they have otherwise still have to concern of social utilization of space. Government agencies play a role in the awareness and law enforcement that actually the land used has a social function that does not fully authorize the citizen to use space.

Socialization is the main function, further *SKPD* held various studies for the development and utilization of Baubau city spatial plan. The law product of Spatial Plan is regional regulation no. 4 years 2014 and RDTR then in its implementation *RDTR* itself has not been complete all that all the sub district in Baubau city has it. When completed, it will be more responsive in its implementation, such as where permitted and unauthorized, which are all listed in the Spatial Detail Plan.

Monitoring and evaluation activities are carried out by special units that can be undertaken by existing institutions, namely Regional Development Planning Board (*BAPPEDA*) and Public Works and Spatial Planning Agency (by establishing a new team in it), or the establishment of a new institutional unit entirely with the implementing authority monitoring and evaluation of space utilization.

Implementation unit of monitoring and evaluation of space utilization has the main duty and function as follows:

- Managing databases related to spatial planning, especially those supporting RTRW monitoring and evaluation activities including in terms of presentation, dissemination, updating, etc.;
- Operating and maintaining an information system for monitoring and evaluation of GIS-based space utilization with the established standard, development and technical guidelines;
- Conduct scheduled monitoring and evaluation activities based on the stipulated requirements and stages.

a. Preparation phase

The preparation stage of monitoring and evaluation of spatial use includes:

- 1. Establishment technical team
- The establishment of a technical team shall be established by a Mayor's Decree on spatial planning for monitoring and evaluation of space utilization;
- 3. The establishment of a technical team may consist of an element of service in charge of Baubau city spatial planning.
- 4. Preparation of a work plan for monitoring and evaluation of spatial plan.

b. Implementation Phase

Implementation phase of monitoring and evaluation of spatial planning is shown in Table 3.4.

Process		Monitoring		Evaluation						
Procedure	Prepar ation	Information & Data Collection	Reporting	Data Compilation & Monitoring Result Information	Data Analysis	Evaluation Result Formulation	Formulat ing Recomm endation			
Technical Team Discussion	•					•	•			
Data Compilation from SKPD		•		• 0						
Observation by Technical Team		•								
Technical Team Report			•				•			
Data Analysis by Technical Team					•					
Reporting to Provincial Government							•			
Reporting to Central Government							• ()			

Table 3.4.Implementation of Monitoring and Evaluation of Spatial Plans

Source: Dinas Pekerjaan Umum dan Penataan Ruang, 2018

3.2. Efficiency

3.2.1. The government has the ability to minimize the budget resources appropriately in the fulfillment of the urban spatial plan implementation yet maximizing the objectives and result of urban spatial plan.

Efficiency is how much effort is needed to achieve the desired results and how much costs and energy are spent, with indicators measured that the budget provided by the government in accordance with the needs in the framework of Baubau city spatial management.

According to the performance report of the Government Institution (LaKIP) of the Public Works Department and Baubau City Spatial Planning in carrying out the main tasks and functions of these agencies get the source of funds from the Regional Revenue and Expenditure Budget (APBD) as well as the Special Allocation Fund in running the city space management program.

In implementing the spatial management performance program, the budget is used by setting budget expenditure targets in order to achieve the realization of efficient performance so that sufficient budget is spent and can achieve the target performance to be achieved. Here is a table detailing the budget used in implementing the performance of space management, as follows:

		2008			2009			2010			2011			2012		
	UKALAN	Realisasi (Rp.)	Capaian (%)	Struktur (%)	Realisasi (Rp.)	Capaian (%)	Struktur (%)	Realisasi (Rp.)	Capaian (%)	Struktur (%)	Realisasi (Rp.)	Capaian (%)	Struktur (%)	Realisasi (Rp.)	Capaian (%)	Struktur (%)
	URUSAN WAJIB	185.432.334.612,00	88,09	94,59	170.741.810.818,00	90,53	90,53	125.199.867.335,00	92,73	92,7	179.689.073.082,00	86,26	95,22	167,254,709,436.00	86.33	86,78
1	Urusan Pendidikan	27.284.391.844,00	85,43	13,92	22.433.120.191,00	94,51	12,14	10.611.065.426,00	49,20	7,86	25.260.880.921,00	72,06	13,39	18,312,104,961.00	61.40	9,50
2	Urusan Kesehatan	16.889.962.743,00	85,78	8,62	20.449.108.846,00	96,67	11,07	9.837.790.882,00	96,36	7,28	11.048.694.743,00	89,78	5,85	13,673,265,886.00	98.54	7,09
3	Urusan Pekerjaan Umum	39.329.449.386,00	94,61	20,06	40.007.322.501,00	95,93	21,65	28.452.952.181,00	98,17	21,07	59.903.849.546,00	88,57	31,74	49,311,897,179.00	97.22	25,59
4	Urusan Perumahan	1.076.781.750,00	97,98	0,00	4.298.317.205,00	96,80	2,33	478.774.300,00	98,21	0,35	3.402.914.600,00	92,22	1,80	8,875,473,299.00	98.81	4,61
5	Urusan Penataan Ruang	805.648.000,00	58,75	0,41	1.403.487.885,00	99,70	0,76	936.385.446,00	98,65	0,69	1.093.841.936,00	99,07	0,58	1,247,384,956.00	99.46	0,65
6	Urusan Perencanaan Pembangunan	4.181.655.910,00	89,73	2,13	2.405.788.909,00	97,82	1,30	2.103.430.685,00	98,88	1,56	1.527.732.884,00	89,77	0,81	3,255,382,899.00	94.54	1,69
7	Urusan Perhubungan	13.573.052.597,00	99,21	6,92	11.408.736.450,00	98,38	6,18	17.627.875.555,00	97,05	13,05	20.490.931.419,00	98,41	10,86	22,491,377,999.00	99.20	11,67
8	Urusan Lingkungan Hidup	6.302.720.775,00	89,34	3,22	6.862.174.727,00	88,56	3,71	6.131.782.840,00	91,74	4,54	6.053.631.478,00	95,48	3,21	6,336,469,071.00	93.21	3,29
9	Urusan Kependudukan dan Catatan Sipil	346.049.033,00	88,36	0,00	993.197.500,00	91,48	0,54	557.144.620,00	98,83	0,41	998.783.760,00	93,77	0,53	727,759,600.00	100.0 0	0,38
1 0	Urusan Pemberdayaan Perempuan dan Perlindungan Anak	26.050.000,00	100,00	0,01	87.895.000,00	100,00	0,05	39.796.000,00	98,96	0,03	71.125.100,00	78,63	0,04	272,759,600.00	94.66	0,14
1	Urusan Keluarga Berencana dan Keluarga	2.232.116.569,00	97,96	1,14	2.206.740.263,00	95,16	1,19	1.701.607.188,00	99,32	1,26	1.398.621.764,00	98,80	0,74	1,713,192,106.00	98.19	0,89

Tabel 3.5.Budget Realization and Achievement of Baubau City per Year 2008-2012

Source: Regional Mid-term Planning, 2017

Based on the above table, the budget used for the space management program is in item number 5 (five) which in 2008 amounted to Rp. 805.648.000,00 with the percentage of budget structure absorbed is 0,41%. Performance in the year for the first indicator of percentage of urban space management realized amounted to 58.75%. In that year, the special financial management of Baubau city spatial planning was far from the target with the performance performed so that the achievement of budget realization was only 58, 75%. In the years that followed the year 2009 and 2010 reached the budget realization of 99.70% and 98.65%.

3.3. Adequacy

3.3.1. The Urban Spatial Plan implementation which monitored and evaluated achieved goals on-time as regulated

The monitoring and evaluation activities of Baubau city spatial planning are carried out continuously with the regular scheme that is annual and 5 years (see chart 3.1). Data and information from monitoring activities are used as input data in the evaluation process. In the evaluation activities, monitoring results are analyzed and processed to produce information for the assessment of the spatial use suitability to the spatial plan regulation of Baubau city.

Chart 3.1. Scheme of Monitoring and Evaluation of Baubau City Spatial Planning 2014-2034

	20 years of Spatial Plans Regulation (Loval Regulation Number 4 Years 2014 of Baubau City)											
	y0	y1	y2	y3	y4	Second 5 years	Third 5 years	Forth 5 years				
	Evaluations aims to overview the implementation of spatial plans		ns ne on	Monitoring of spatial plans imple- mentation compare to spatial plans regulation and prior- ity program indica- tions	Monitoring of spatial plans imple- mentation compare to spatial plans regulation and prior- ity program indica- tions	Monitoring of spatial plans imple- mentation compare to spatial plans regulation and prior- ity program indica- tions	Monitoring of spatial plans imple- mentation compare to spatial plans regulation and final plan targets					
Moni curren situat begin	toring nt ion ning J	spat as t point	of ial he			Evaluation aims to revise current spatial plans	Evaluation aims to do adjustment or revise current spatial plans implemented	Evaluation aims to do adjustment or revise current spatial plans implemented	Evaluation aims to determine the achievements in form of goals and targets of spatial plans			

Source: Personal Data Analysis, 2018

The presented scheme of Chart 3.1. showing that the government of Baubau city has managed the time management of monitoring and evaluation of Urban Spatial Plans implementation through 20 years implementation. Monitoring of Baubau city space utilization is done through three stages: preparation stage; phase of data and information gathering; and reporting stage.

a. Preparation phase

Activities undertaken in the preparation stage include:

- 1. Preparation of regional spatial plan documents;
- 2. Preparation of data list, questionnaire, and others; and
- 3. Preparation of data formats and information to be collected in matrix form. This matrix contains information about:
 - Monitoring aspects, including: space structure and spatial pattern;

- Delineation of monitoring location;
- qualitative measures for space structure (in the form of: availability and conformity checklist); and
- Quantitative measures for spatial patterns (in the form of: area, percentage).
- 4. Preparation of geographic information system-based spatial map which represents with scale as stipulated;
- 5. Preparation of observation schedule and preparation of field surveyor team.
- b. Data Collection and Information Stages

The collection of data and information is conducted by surveyor officers appointed by the agency / work unit authorized to monitor. The activities of data collection and information, at least include:

- Data and information field observation in the form of actual condition of space structure and spatial pattern;
- Data and information, whether in form of width measurement or other qualitative measures, should be translatable into the matrix / monitoring table;
- 3. Spatial data and information are presented in a format compatible with geographic information systems (GIS).
- c. The collection of data and information is carried out by surveyor officers appointed by the agency / work unit authorized to monitor;
- d. Reporting Stage

The results of the monitoring / investigation in the field are then prepared in the form of report on the utilization of space.

Evaluation of space utilization is done in three stages, namely: data and information compilation stage, data and information analysis phase, and formulation phase of evaluation result.

a. Stage of data and information compilation

Activities undertaken at this stage of data and information compilation include:

- Collecting data and information of monitoring result in the form of monitoring result report;
- 2. Group the data into categories of indicators.
- Comparing data and information on each indicator with the content of Baubau City Spatial Plan by preparing the assessment criteria.
- b. Stage of data analysis

The least data analysis activities include:

- Analysis of field observation data in the form of actual condition of space structure and spatial pattern;
- 2. Analysis of data and information transformation, in the form of size and other qualitative size, into the matrix / monitoring table;
- 3. Analysis of spatial data in a format compatible with geographic information systems.

The results of collecting data and information activities are collected in data and analysis books.

c. Formulation of evaluation phase

Activities undertaken at this stage of the formulation of the evaluation include:

- Assessing the suitability level of space utilization is obtained from the calculation of the total suitability (number of space structure and spatial pattern) between actual utilization with program indication and / or with spatial plan.
- Sub-indicator analysis is the main problem that has the lowest level of conformity. This analysis can also be traced to objects on sub indicators that have the lowest level of conformity.
- To calculate the total value of evaluation, each indicator is considered to have equal weight, with total value considered equal to 100%, adjusted to Baubau city characteristic.
- 4. Formulate recommendations based on the percentage of suitability level of general space utilization.
- d. Reporting Stage

The results of the space utilization evaluation are then prepared in the form of an evaluation report on space utilization. This report is structured in a formatted standard so that it can be used to see trends in the magnitude and direction of changes in space utilization year to year.

3.4. Equity

3.4.1. The implementation of urban spatial plan provides equitable means for the whole citizen scoping the openness and protection towards public interest.

Baubau City which has an area of 221 Ha in particular has unique

characteristic that is the division of urban areas and rural areas inside the Baubau

city itself which define the city that it is not a whole urban area. The urban areas

consist of Wolio, Murhum and Batupoaro sub districts are already densely

populated with occupancy (see table 4.1).

 Table 3.7.

 Number of Population, Household and Average of Household Members by Sub-District in Bau-Bau City, 2015

District in Dun Cuy, 2015							
No	Sub District	Population (People)	Total Household	Average Household Members			
1	Betoambari	18.433	4.090	4			
2	Murhum	21.793	4.685	4			
3	Batupoaro	29.291	5.711	5			
4	Wolio	42.862	8.816	4			
5	Kokalukuna	18.929	3.813	5			
6	Sorawolio	8.025	1.504	5			
7	Bungi	8.030	1.630	5			
8	Lea-Lea	7.514	1.651	4			
	Total	154.877	33.085	4			

Source: Kota Bau-Bau dalam Angka, 2016

Rural areas are called buffer zones which consists of Lea-lea, Bungi and Sorawolio sub-districts because they are genuinely agricultural and plantation areas or largely conservation areas (see Figure 4 ...). Baubau has hilly topography (see figure 4) which means that the surrounding area that is categorized as rural area i.e. buffer zone to maintain environmental balance, for example in Sorawolio area there has been a request for a nickel mining permit but it is not permitted because it's not in accordance with the designation of conflicting land with Green Open Space Design (RTH).

Baubau city is still centered its development around Wolio sub-district, which further in 5 (five) years ago born a new policy to distribute the functions of urban space services, therefore around Betoambari there are several areas ready to build such as residential areas and offices for example office area in palagimata as area offices, followed by the construction of the Development Planning Agency at Sub-National Level (*BAPPEDA*) office, the House of Representatives making the area as a ready-to-build area. However, in the spatial plans (*RTRW*) study the location or area is limited to high density housing or any construction on its land because the area enters the conservation area i.e. the area where the soil structure of the area is hollow, therefore there is plenty of water and cave in the area (*Palagimata*) such as the *Lakasa* cave.

Government Affairs Mandatory Regarding Basic Service of People's Housing and Settlement Area is implemented by Housing and Settlement Government unit. Development achievements that have been generated in year 2013-2015 are as follows:

- Establishment of low-cost rental apartments as much as 4 blocks, student dormitory 2 blocks and number of public housing development by developers in 7 locations.
- Irreplaceable house which is repaired by 190 houses; roads of neighborhoods built along 5.990 meters; General street illumination lamps installed as many as 1700 point.
- The availability of a well-functioning fire extinguisher of 5 units; well-

functioning water hydrants of 6 units.

• Availability of cemetery area managed by local government of 5.8 Ha; and

the number of hearses as much as 2 units.

• Increased availability of spatial documentation.

Indicator	Achievement in 2014
Percentage of shelter needs fulfilled	68%
Percentage of settled area	65%
The location of the organized slum area	5
Percentage of households with sanitation	81%
Percentage of habitable home	75,22%
Number of households with clean water users	85%
Number of household with electrical users	85%

 Table 3.6.

 Performance indicators of public housing affairs

Source: Dinas Perumahan dan Kawasan Permukiman, 2015

Baubau city currently began the trend of spatial planning that is a shift to the west and east for the development of the city itself because the middle area is densely occupied and has solid activities, for example in Betoambari sub disctrict there are many housing develops. The new focus of development in Baubau city rooted from the reason that if the development centered in Wolio again then it is not possible with 8.816 household already exists.

Baubau city spatial planning instruments are placed in existing policies such as spatial plans regulation product such as *RTRW*, *RDTR*, and *RTBL* so that the objective of spatial plan is the consistency between the planned regulation and the one in the field or implementation in the scope of space structure and space pattern. Monitoring and Evaluation plays a significant role in maintaining the suitability between on-site and planning. When the Baubau Municipal Government monitors and evaluates, occurred some incompatibilities in the field the its mean the followup is making recommendations. The problem of spatial planning itself has a different typology or approach in each region so that the recommendations will also vary, for example in coastal areas, agricultural areas, trade and service areas, and densely populated areas. Monitoring and evaluation in Baubau city layout there are 3 types of monitoring and evaluation categories, namely:

1. Monitoring and evaluation of planning

- 2. Monitoring and evaluation of spatial use implementation
- 3. Post space utilization evaluation

All three monitoring and evaluation are expected later on to the recommendation of Follow Up Plans that should be implemented in the field conducted every year such as outbreak indicator and regional designation. The most recent is the monitoring and evaluation for Bungi and Lea-lea sub-district agriculture areas where in the field the government find the inconsistency of spatial planning issues over land functions that are not only regulated in the *RTRW* law but also Law number 41 of 2009 on Sustainable Agriculture Land that no conversion of land or agriculture should be allowed to any function.

The most significant is the typology of Baubau city as a coastal city and the characteristics of its people. Spatial plan policy is almost the same in each region, which distinguishes the holistic approaches, for example Baubau as a coastal city will be the same as *Pare-pare* but it will only be different because of the different characteristics of its society with Baubau. The problem of spatial planning is more emphasized on the involvement of citizen participation as a whole. The community as landowners generally asume that they have full rights of construction over the land and development will continue constantly while the government cannot be

arbitrary to prohibit the development, which is done by the government is to curb the development.

3.4.2. The existence of Spatial Plan Implementation has purpose on creating sense of security, comfortable, productive, and sustainable for the whole citizen in Baubau city.

Creating sense of security, comfortable, productive, and sustainable for the whole citizen in Baubau city is a great challenge for the government in Baubau city. Discussing about the slums, how slums can be reduced is the basic necessity to help the low-economic citizen so that houses that fall into the category of slums can be more livable such as the direction of the development of flats in Wameo and Kotamara Green City (see figure 3.1 and 3.2).

Figure 3.1. Wameo Public Housing



Source: Personal Documentation, 2018

Figure 3.2. Kotamara Green City



Source: Personal Documentation, 2018

A crucial issue also hotel problems that generally have supporting facilities, but for Baubau city itself generally do not have a supporting car park which in its construction using the road body. Parking is considered vital as a key facility for the distribution of goods and services. It is done not also by the hotels, but many private constructions in Baubau city mostly used for business purpose.



Figure 3.3.

Source: Personal Documentation, 2018

In one case Baubau has a Sorawolio fortress, there is actually a regulation in spatial plan regulation which address the radius that should not allow the community building around the cultural heritage otherwise the citizen awareness is still insignificant.

3.5. Responsiveness

3.5.1. The ability of government units in Urban Spatial Plan implementation to understand the need of citizen and services priority on Urban Spatial Plan implementation

In measuring the responsiveness of responsible government units of urban planning, there are indicators of services delivery to the citizen to fulfill the responsiveness key performances of government as shown in 3.7 below.

Table 3.7.						
Achievement Indicators of Services Delivery on Public Work and Urban Planning of Baubau City						

Field of Government	Program	Initial Performance		Program Performance and Funding Framework Achievements							Performance	Responsible				
Affairs and Priority	Performance	Condition of RPJMD	Year	2013	Year	: 2014	Year	2015	Yea	r 2016	Year	r 2017	Yea	r 2018	Conditions at the	Government
Development Program	Indicators	(Year 2012)	Target (%)	Rp (Million)	Target (%)	Rp (Million)	Target (%)	Rp (Million)	Target (%)	Rp (Million)	Target (%)	Rp (Million)	Target (%)	Rp (Million)	End of the RPJMD	Unit
1.3. General Work																
1.3.1. General Work and																
Spatial Plan Unit																
1. Administration of office administration program	Coverage of administrative office services	25	45	650	70	660	75	670	90	675	90	680	95	685	95	General Work and Spatial Plan Unit
2. Improvement of facilities and infrastructure apparatus program	Coverage service facilities and infrastructure apparatus	60	70	186	75	190	83	195	85	200	70	200	100	210	100	General Work and Spatial Plan Unit
3. Apparatus discipline improvement program	Coverage of uniform use of civil servants	30	30	33	75	34	75	36	85	40	80	42	95	45	90	General Work and Spatial Plan Unit
4. Capacity building program of apparatus resources	Percentage of apparatus resources that have competence according to their field	65	70	20	75	23	80	25	80	30	85	33	95	35	95	General Work and Spatial Plan Unit
5. Improved program development of performance reporting and financial reporting systems	The level of accuracy submits performance and financial reports	8 Dok	8 Dok	24	8 Dok	24	8	24	8 Dok	24	8 Dok	24	8 Dok	24	8 Dok	General Work and Spatial Plan Unit

Source: RPJMD of Baubau City, 2017

From the table 3.7 above, it shows the key indicator of responsiveness towards the citizen by the government of Baubau city as the services provider in term of public works and urban plans by reaching the achievement of 95% of performance conditions at the end of the *RPJMD* implementation especially in administrative of office administration program.

To see the tendency of monitoring and evaluation on the arrangement and utilization of Baubau city space, then the government saw how the shift of land use or space. Analysis of land use and landuse is done to know and evaluate how far the level of urban development has been implemented. This analysis is carried out by comparing land and waking land. Based on the results of the analysis, it is found that the ratio of land area built to the total area of Baubau City is relatively low at 4.45% or about 1,405.13 ha from 31,550.25 ha of Baubau City overall area. While the area that has not been built has an area of 30,145.12 ha or 95.55% of the total area of Baubau City. The undeveloped area in question is dominated by forest land utilization with an area of 28,729.15 ha or 91.06%. Other land utilization is used for mixed plantation of 163,84 ha or 0,52%, open land area of 322,67 or 1.03%, paddy area of 840,55 ha or equal to 2,66%, river area of 12, 75 ha or equal to 0.04% and moor area of 75.16 ha or 0.24% of the total area of Baubau City. The use and land use of Baubau City is presented in Table 4.2.

Land Use	Category	Width (Ha)	Percentage
Airport	Used Land	33.39	0.11
Housing Block	Used Land	1000.92	3.17
Exhibition Hall	Used Land	0.51	0.00
Church	Used Land	0.1	0.00
Warehouse	Used Land	19.71	0.06
Hotel	Used Land	3.16	0.01
Road	Used Land	140.67	0.45
Campus	Used Land	2.38	0.01
Currently Develop Land	Used Land	18.23	0.06
Mosque	Used Land	5.32	0.02
Market	Used Land	3.58	0.01
Grave	Used Land	3.64	0.01
Port	Used Land	15.33	0.05
Offices Block	Used Land	40.48	0.13
Store	Used Land	24.03	0.08
Company	Used Land	19.16	0.06
Gasoline Station	Used Land	1.03	0.00
Temple	Used Land	0.03	0.00
Department Sore	Used Land	3.43	0.01
Green Space	Used Land	15.9	0.05
School	Used Land	52.93	0.17
Terminal	Used Land	1.2	0.00
Si	um	1405.13	4.45
Forest	Un-used Land	28729.15	91.06
Mixed garden	Un-used Land	163.84	0.52
Open Land	Un-used Land	323.67	1.03
Rice Field	Un-used Land	840.55	2.66
River	Un-used Land	12.75	0.04
Tegalan	Un-used Land	75.16	0.24
Si	95.55		
Т	otal	31550.25	100.00

Table 3.8. Existing Land-Use of Baubau City

Source: Dinas Pekerjaan Umum dan Penataan Ruang, 2018

Settlements can be measured using satellite imagery maps in spatial view year

to year, indicating how much land in Baubau city has been built.

Figure 3.4. Map of Existing Land-use of Baubau City



Source: Dinas Pekerjaan Umum dan Penataan Ruang, 2018

Typology of Baubau city as a coastal city is very influential in the development of Baubau city. The function of Baubau city in accordance with the Spatial Detail Plan (RDTR) is as a center of trade and services which further make the port of Murhum becomes a center for strengthening inter-island liaison facilities. Most of the surrounding areas such as Wakatobi, Southern Buton, Central Buton and North Buton lead to the town of Baubau as compared to the surrounding area, Baubau city is more advanced in terms of accessibility.



Figure 3.5.

Source: Dinas Pekerjaan Umum dan Penataan Ruang, 2018

This structure has implications toward the function that is the escalation in the economic activity, small samples illustrated by residents from outside of the city came to buy basic needs and entertainment in Baubau City.

An important tool in overseeing the spatial arrangement of Baubau city is an effective information system to become the main control tool on how spatial planning in Baubau city can be consistent and controllable. Therefore, the Baubau city government has a geospatial information system that is controlled quarterly how much space has been utilized and how much land has not been utilized or should not be converted / used for physical development, especially conservation areas or protected forest areas that become significantly vital because there are people who build in the conservation area so that it becomes the authority of the Conservation Agency and the unit coordinates with the relevant parties.

In essence, how to keep the spatial plan in Baubau city can be consistent with what happens in the field such as agricultural areas. Therefore, the procedure when there is a society or institution that wants to build it will be adjusted to the spatial plan. The most crucial monitoring and evaluation concerns are the areas of agriculture and protected forest areas. In agriculture, the most frequent occurrence is the change of land function (conversion) that had been converted into a residential area. Then significant to be supervised is technical irrigation. Consequently, the point is mapping with the information system of Baubau city government may know the spatial plan with the condition of the temporary (existing) in terms of area and in terms of quantity.

Walking across the road in Baubau city, there will be many signs that prohibit building in certain area or development procedure in the area according to spatial plan (*RTRW*) Regional Regulation which is one of effort to do monitoring and evaluation by the government. The courage of the government by giving a sign of the signpost is when people want to build a construction the first step is to pay attention to the area and consult with the parties related to spatial arrangements such as Public Works and Spatial Planning Agency. Again, spatial discourse includes aspects of fairness, flexibility or non-rigidity, i.e., negotiation or coordination between the community and

government yet above the prevailing rules.



Source: Personal Documentation, 2018



Source: Personal Documentation, 2018

Figure 3.8. Information Board of Construction Prohibition around Airport Zone



Source: Personal Documentation, 2018

Figure 3.9. Information Board of Construction Prohibition in Green Open Space Zone



Source: Personal Documentation, 2018

Information Board is the information shared to the public in regards of prohibition or procedure of building a construction over a certain land in Baubau city for example at Betoambari Airport (see figure 3.8). In spatial plan, the crucial thing to note is Green Open Space appears in road that there is a sign which announces prohibition to build in the Green Open Space area (see figure 3.9) then for example in some way there is information that the line in certain area is e.g. 10,5 meters (see figure 3.7) and so it becomes one of the monitoring and evaluation of space utilization in the field. After the installation of the information board, the next follow-up is to direct monitoring to the field whether there is a change or not.

Within one year the government of Baubau city through the Agency or Institute related to spatial planning reported whether the space shift is in accordance with the spatial plan or not further being a follow-up to be given to each sub-district for advancing development. From the problem of Baubau city spatial development, there are procedures conducted by the government in case of violations in its implementation. The first step is a reprimand or verbal submission followed by a 3 (three)-times written submission. If 3 times is ignored, it will be dismantled, for example there are some houses that do not fit with the street line and the case of hotel construction that is not in accordance with the Coefficient of Building Area (*KLB*) is not in accordance with the permit given that should be built 5 floors, but build a construction with 6 floors. In such cases, Baubau city government formed a joint team based on the Mayor's Decree (*SK*) which consists of the *SKPD* of Baubau City involving the police in the sphere of law enforcement. Additionally, the number of Baubau city spatial control reports is presented in the table 3.9.

Supervision 2017							
Reporting	Not Reporting	Total					
143	139	282					

Table 3.9.

Source: (Department of Public Works and Spatial Planning, 2017)

Communities can provide reports on spatial use issues to the implementers of monitoring and evaluation activities of spatial use of the territory in the form of complaints.

A complaint is a notification from the recipient of the service containing information about the discrepancy between the actual conditions of space utilization in the field and the planned spatial plan. Reporting must be accompanied by a clear and accountable reason and identity the reporter and carried out in accordance with the laws and regulations.

Means of delivery of citizen results supervision include to post office box, website, or short message service.

Completion of complaints is carried out under the following conditions:

1. Applicant submits complaints either directly or through the media of information services and complaints that have been provided online, in terms of monitoring and evaluation by the Agency in accordance with the provisions of legislation;

- Government Agency has obligation to sort and follow up complaints submitted by the complainant; Agency clarifies complaints to related *SKPD* for assessment;
- Agency conveys the results of follow-up and clarification of complaint to the complainant.

3.6. Accuracy

3.6.1. Location setting distribution of the Regional Spatial Plan, such as office area, trade and service area and green open area according to the needs of the community

Baubau City serves as the National Activity Center (PKN), with service coverage area covering Southeast Sulawesi Islands and some areas in Eastern Indonesia. Based on the revised RTRW of Baubau City 2014-2034 Baubau City's spatial structure plan includes a system of service centers that berhierarki and city infrastructure network system. The system of municipal service centers includes a municipal service center, a sub-city center, and an environmental center. By developing a municipal service center, Baubau City's service center structure will shift from one center (monocentric) to a plural center (polysentric).

The existence of a number of urban centers is intended to further encourage the development of the city to the west so that the development of the city between the north, south and west can be more evenly. The development of urban centers is an effort to reduce the very high dependence on urban centers located in Wale Sub-District, Wolio Sub-district.

While the development of sub-centers of urban activity serves as a buffer area of urban service centers, and even distribution of services at the sub-district scale. The distribution of sub service centers of the city is also intended to support the development and growth of development areas between districts.

Geographically the city service center will be located on the western, southern and eastern regions of the city. The new city activity center is expected to remain in synergy with the existing city center. Likewise, the urban service sub-centers are expected to remain in synergy with the existing sub-centers of primary and urban services. Together, these centers are expected to contribute to the existence of existing / emerging cities. It therefore needs to be supported by a reliable transport system for shuttle mobility between service centers.

Baubau City area service center hierarchy plan is divided into 3 levels namely:

- a. The municipal service center (PPK) serves all areas of the city and / or region;
- b. Urban service sub-centers (SPK) serving sub-city areas (SWK); and
- c. Center of the environment (PL). To support the planned space structure, territory

Baubau City is divided into seven Sub-City Areas (SWK) served by seven Sub-Service Centers of City (SPK) and two Municipal Service Centers (PPK). For more details, the city service system in Baubau can be seen in Table .3.10 as follows:

City Services No. Location **Services Function** System

Table 3.10. Service Centers of Baubau City 2017

		Kec. Betoambari	Center of governance
1	City center	Kecamatan Wolio	The center for marine transportation activities and trade and service centers,
2	Sub-center of the city	Kel. Lamangga Kec. Murhum	Government service center
		Kel. Katobengke Kec. Betoambari	Government service centers, higher education, airports, tourism, fuel depots and housing
		Kel. Waruruma Kec. Kokalukuna	Government service center, tourism industry, fishery, processing industry, trade, warehousing and housing
		Kel. Liabuku Kec. Bungi	Government service centers, housing, food crops and forestry
		Kel. Kaisabu Baru Kec. Sorawolio	Central government service, agriculture, plantation, forestry and mining
		Kel. Lowu-lowu dan Kolese Kec. Lea-lea	Housing, fishing, sports facilities and energy / electricity infrastructure
		Kel. Wameo Kec. Batupoaro	Central government services, trade and services
3	Environmental center	Kel. Bataraguru Kec. Wolio	Center for trade and services
		Kel. Nganganaumala Kec. Batupoaro	Center for trade and services
		Kel. Lipu Kec. Betoambari	Central government services, education and housing
		Kel. Liwuto Kec. Kokalukuna	Government and tourism service center
		Kel. Waliabuku Kec. Bungi	Government and agriculture service center
		Kel. Karya Baru Kec. Sorawolio	Government and agriculture service centers, trade and services
		Kel. Kalia-lia Kec. Lea- lea	Center for trade and services

Source: Peraturan Daerah Nomor 4 Tahun 2014 tentang Rencana Tata Ruang Wilayah Kota Baubau Tahun 2014-2034.

3.7. The Challenges on Baubau City Spatial Plan Implementation

The significant problem that Baubau city spatial plan face is the issue of public awareness in the form of information or benefit socialization of Baubau City Spatial Planning and Green Open Space for the survival of society in Baubau City.

The significant factor in the field is the community's understanding of the importance of directional spatial planning. The general matters in Baubau urban sprawl, for example in coastal areas, are not allowed to build due to the 15-meter demarcation rules but the community assumes that they have full rights over their land, the community will continue to build a construction. Also included in green open spaces, communities and government are less coordinated for example when the community has a land certificate, the perception that grows is the right to build on the land is completely, also very significant is the relevant institution issuing the land certificate similarly there is no coordination with the agency that handles the space that should be considerably before issuing the land certificate, which must be considered is conformity with the spatial plan regulation (RTRW) or the guidelines. Furthermore, there is a spatial coordination forum, namely BKPRD (Coordinating Board of Regional Spatial Planning) which is attended by all related agencies that participate in spatial planning usually discuss spatial planning agenda. BKPRD itself has a working group in relation to space monitoring, evaluation and space utilization. It is often what is planned is not in accordance with the implementation caused by the various interests that enter the spatial arrangement. Spatial Plan (RTRW) is a legal product that should be obeyed by all elements of society and government agencies, but there are often government agencies that violate the rules by building physical buildings such as in conservation or reclamation areas. This is generally due to the economic benefits that can be gained from build a construction in the prohibited region.

The new one is the problem of motor and car washing that builds on the land which is spatial configuration about the line of road is broken, the distance is equal to the road 10 meters but less, then the consequences of the violating buildings have an impact on the surrounding community activities despite the rights owned land is theirs so there is a clash between surrounding land users because their buildings demand high mobilization (vehicle entry). It all turn back again to the government as a service provider that became the input that the government has not been optimal in educating.

In term of urban spatial planning, it is a dynamic thing that this problem commonly occur which shows it is not a static problem caused by continuous development and will change time to time. The problem that will be faced by the community as the recipient of the service and the government as the service provider. Then the government in this case has made various regulations or rules related on how the procedure of space utilization and it has been implemented in the form of implementation of spatial implementation monitoring continuously conduct supervision in the field such as buildings that violate or new areas to be opened. The most common problem that arises is to collide with the interests of the people who do not understand the importance of space utilization or in this case the ego as a society that assume full ownership of the land owned but the community has not understood that the aspect of spatial planning in Baubau not only covers the individual aspect. The government mapped Baubau city space in a comprehensive way, not partially. It is also a weakness of the government that has not been maximized in disseminating some policies that have been made. Then, the next problem is the participation of the community that has not been maximized, causing the government as a service provider to get several impacts in the field because the community has not understood and the government is also not maximized then it becomes a joint task to socialize mainly through print media, as well as direct socialization in *kelurahan* and sub-district or every time the government get off the field, by the violating community we are trying to discuss how the spatial arrangement in the region should be at the same time providing a broad understanding of the social function of space. If the most significant problem is the lack of public understanding because the problem of spatial planning is not just a problem today. There are many examples of how then spatial planning is not conducted monitoring and evaluation systematically resulting in impacts such as flooding and traffic congestion.